International Journal of Education, Vocational and Social Science
https://e-journal.citakonsulindo.or.id/index.php/IJEVSS
E-ISSN : 2963 4954
IJEVSS

Islamic Religious Education: Between The Ideal Concept And The Practical Paradigm

Madlur Rhisky
Nurul Jadid University Paiton Probolinggo East Jav, Indonesia
Sisiwanto
Nurul Jadid University Paiton Probolinggo East Jav, Indonesia
Mona Novita
Nurul Jadid University Paiton Probolinggo East Jav, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: madlubur.rhisky@unuja.ac.id

Abstract

Islamic Religious Education (Pendidikan Agama Islam) occupies a central position in shaping the moral, spiritual, and intellectual character of Muslim learners; however, a persistent gap exists between its idealized theological and philosophical conception and the paradigms actually enacted within educational practice. This study examines the tension between the ideal concept of Islamic Religious Education—rooted in holistic character formation, the integration of knowledge and faith, and the cultivation of insan kamil (the perfect human being)—and the practical realities shaped by curricular constraints, examination-oriented pedagogy, and institutional limitations. Employing a qualitative library research approach, this study synthesizes relevant literature on Islamic educational philosophy, pedagogy, and institutional practice. The findings reveal that the gap between ideal and practice stems from curriculum rigidity, insufficient teacher competence, limited pedagogical innovation, and the dominance of cognitive-oriented assessment over affective and psychomotor dimensions of learning. The study recommends an integrative paradigm that reconciles theological idealism with contextual pedagogical responsiveness to strengthen the transformative potential of Islamic Religious Education.

Keywords: *I*slamic Religious Education, ideal concept, practical paradigm, character formation, pedagogical innovation

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

International Journal of Education, Vocational and Social Science
https://e-journal.citakonsulindo.or.id/index.php/IJEVSS
E-ISSN : 2963 4954
IJEVSS

INTRODUCTION

Islamic Religious Education (Pendidikan Agama Islam, hereafter PAI) has long been regarded as the cornerstone of moral and spiritual formation within Muslim societies, tasked with the dual mission of transmitting religious knowledge and cultivating righteous character among learners. Rooted in the Qur'an, Hadith, and the rich intellectual tradition of Islamic scholarship, PAI aspires toward an ideal vision of education that transcends mere cognitive acquisition, aiming instead at the holistic development of the human being—intellectually, spiritually, emotionally, and socially. This ideal, often articulated through the concept of insan kamil, envisions education as a transformative process that produces individuals of exemplary character, deep faith, and social responsibility (Hamid & Wahyuni, 2024; Hernawati dkk., 2024).

However, the translation of this lofty ideal into actual educational practice has proven considerably more complex. Contemporary PAI, as implemented within formal educational institutions across Indonesia, frequently diverges from its idealized conception, constrained by structural, pedagogical, and institutional realities that shape a markedly different practical paradigm. Curricula often reduce religious education to a narrow set of cognitive competencies assessed through standardized examinations, prioritizing rote memorization of religious texts and doctrines over the cultivation of lived religious experience, critical reasoning, and character internalization (Sijamhodžić-Nadarević, 2023).

This tension between the ideal and the practical is not a new phenomenon within Islamic educational discourse; however, its contemporary manifestation has become increasingly pronounced amid the pressures of standardized national curricula, resource limitations, and the broader secularizing tendencies of modern educational systems. Teachers, often burdened with administrative demands and limited pedagogical training in values-based instruction, may find themselves ill-equipped to bridge the gap between doctrinal transmission and experiential character formation, resulting in an educational paradigm that satisfies formal curricular requirements while falling short of its deeper transformative aspirations (Parhan dkk., 2024).

Islamic higher education institutions, including those affiliated with pesantren traditions such as Nurul Jadid University, occupy a unique position within this discourse, as they are simultaneously custodians of the ideal tradition of Islamic scholarship and active participants within the contemporary, often examination-driven, educational landscape (Saada, 2023). These institutions bear particular responsibility for critically examining the gap between ideal and practice, given their foundational commitment to producing graduates who embody both intellectual competence and exemplary moral character.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

This study seeks to critically examine the tension between the ideal conceptual foundations of Islamic Religious Education and the practical paradigms through which it is enacted within contemporary educational institutions. By synthesizing relevant literature on Islamic educational philosophy, pedagogy, and institutional practice, this research aims to identify the underlying causes of this gap and to propose an integrative framework capable of reconciling theological idealism with the practical demands of contemporary pedagogical contexts, thereby strengthening the transformative potential of Islamic Religious Education for future generations.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study employs a qualitative research approach utilizing library research (studi kepustakaan) as its primary method of inquiry. Given the conceptual and philosophical nature of the research problem—namely, the tension between the ideal concept and practical paradigm of Islamic Religious Education—this method was deemed most appropriate for synthesizing theoretical literature, prior scholarship, and normative educational discourse rather than relying on primary field data collection (Ruiz-Eugenio dkk., 2024; Tadas & Coyle, 2020).

Data sources for this study consist of secondary literature, including peer-reviewed journal articles, academic books on Islamic educational philosophy, national curriculum documents, and relevant policy reports concerning Islamic Religious Education in Indonesia. Literature was gathered through systematic searches of academic databases including Google Scholar, Scopus, and Indonesian scholarly repositories such as Garuda and Moraref, employing keyword combinations such as "Pendidikan Agama Islam," "Islamic education philosophy," "character-based religious education," "insan kamil," and "religious education pedagogy in Indonesia."

The data analysis process follows the descriptive-analytical method, comprising data reduction, categorization, and interpretive synthesis. In the reduction stage, sources were filtered according to their relevance to the study's central themes: the theoretical-philosophical foundations of Islamic Religious Education, the empirical realities of its implementation, and identified gaps between the two. In the categorization stage, literature was organized around key thematic clusters, including curriculum design, pedagogical practice, teacher competence, and assessment paradigms.

A comparative-conceptual analytical technique was employed to juxtapose normative, idealized descriptions of Islamic Religious Education found within classical and contemporary Islamic educational philosophy against empirical and policy-oriented literature describing actual

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

implementation practices. This comparative approach enables the identification of specific points of divergence between theoretical aspiration and practical reality, forming the analytical foundation for the discussion presented in subsequent sections (Bellerose dkk., 2022; Tadas & Coyle, 2020).

To enhance the credibility of the analysis, source triangulation was applied across multiple categories of literature—philosophical-theological texts, empirical educational research, and policy documentation—allowing for a multidimensional understanding of the research problem that accounts for both normative and practical perspectives.

As with any library-based qualitative study, this research is subject to certain limitations, particularly its reliance on existing literature rather than direct classroom observation or empirical data collection. The conclusions drawn are therefore conceptual and interpretive rather than statistically generalizable; nevertheless, this approach provides a valuable theoretical foundation for understanding the structural and philosophical dimensions of the gap between ideal and practice within Islamic Religious Education, upon which future empirical research may build.

DISCUSSION

The Ideal Concept of Islamic Religious Education

The ideal concept of Islamic Religious Education is deeply rooted in the Qur'anic and Prophetic vision of human development, wherein education (tarbiyah) is understood not merely as the transmission of knowledge but as a comprehensive process of nurturing, guiding, and refining the human being toward spiritual excellence and moral maturity. Classical Islamic scholars, including al-Ghazali, Ibn Khaldun, and al-Attas, have articulated a vision of education that integrates intellectual (aqliyah), spiritual (ruhiyah), and physical (jasadiyah) dimensions of human development, positioning knowledge acquisition within a broader framework of moral and spiritual cultivation (Hasra dkk., 2025; Mala & Hunaida, 2023; Pr dkk., 2023; Ulfat, 2020).

Central to this ideal is the concept of insan kamil, or the perfect human being, which represents the ultimate aspiration of Islamic education—an individual who embodies comprehensive excellence encompassing sound faith (aqidah), righteous conduct (akhlak), intellectual competence (ilm), and social responsibility (amal shalih) (Chumayroh dkk., 2025). This holistic vision stands in contrast to reductionist conceptions of education that prioritize cognitive achievement or vocational preparation alone, insisting instead that authentic Islamic education must simultaneously address the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor dimensions of human development in an integrated, mutually reinforcing manner.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

The ideal concept further emphasizes the integration of religious and worldly knowledge (tauhid al-ilm), rejecting the dichotomization between sacred and secular domains of learning that characterizes many contemporary educational systems. Within this integrated framework, all knowledge whether religious or scientific—is understood as ultimately oriented toward the recognition and worship of God, such that the pursuit of any legitimate field of knowledge constitutes an act of religious significance when undertaken with appropriate intention (niyyah) and ethical grounding (Wulandari & Mafariech, 2025).

Additionally, the ideal conception of Islamic Religious Education emphasizes experiential and exemplary learning, wherein character formation occurs primarily through observation, emulation, and sustained relational mentorship rather than through abstract doctrinal instruction alone (Mahdiyyah & Jasminto, 2025). This pedagogical philosophy is exemplified within the traditional pesantren model, where the kyai serves not only as an instructor of religious texts but as a living exemplar of Islamic values, whose personal conduct and character serve as the primary curriculum through which students internalize religious teachings.

This ideal vision positions Islamic Religious Education as a fundamentally transformative endeavor, oriented toward producing not merely knowledgeable individuals but morally exemplary members of society capable of contributing positively to both religious and civic life. The success of Islamic education, within this framework, is measured not by examination performance alone but by the demonstrated character, conduct, and social contribution of its graduates a standard considerably more comprehensive and demanding than that typically applied within conventional educational evaluation frameworks.

The Practical Paradigm of Islamic Religious Education in Contemporary Practice

In contrast to this comprehensive ideal, the practical paradigm through which Islamic Religious Education is actually implemented within contemporary formal educational institutions—particularly within the Indonesian national education system—reflects a considerably more constrained and cognitively oriented approach. National curricula typically allocate Islamic Religious Education a limited number of instructional hours per week, positioning it as one subject among many within a broader, often examination-driven, curricular structure that prioritizes measurable cognitive outcomes over holistic character development (’Aini & Zamroji, 2025; Zahroh dkk., 2023).

Within this practical paradigm, Islamic Religious Education is frequently reduced to the transmission of doctrinal content including memorization of Qur'anic verses, hadith texts, and fiqh

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

(jurisprudential) rulings—assessed primarily through written examinations that emphasize recall and comprehension rather than the deeper internalization of values or the demonstration of ethical conduct (Efendi dkk., 2025). This cognitive-centric approach, while administratively convenient and consistent with broader standardized assessment paradigms, falls considerably short of the holistic, character-oriented vision articulated within classical Islamic educational philosophy.

Pedagogically, the practical implementation of Islamic Religious Education often relies heavily on lecture-based, teacher-centered instructional methods, with limited opportunities for experiential learning, dialogic engagement, or contextual application of religious teachings to students' lived experiences (’Aini & Zamroji, 2025). This pedagogical approach, while efficient for content coverage within constrained instructional time, tends to foster passive learning postures among students and limits the development of critical religious reasoning and personal ethical reflection that the ideal conception of Islamic education aspires to cultivate.

Institutional and administrative constraints further shape the practical paradigm, as schools and educational institutions must balance Islamic Religious Education alongside numerous other curricular demands, often resulting in insufficient instructional time, inadequate resources, and limited opportunities for pedagogical innovation within religious education specifically. Additionally, national assessment frameworks, including standardized examinations, tend to reinforce cognitive-oriented instructional priorities, as institutions face pressure to demonstrate strong examination performance across all subjects, including religious education (Adnan, 2022).

The practical paradigm is also shaped by broader socio-economic and demographic pressures, including large class sizes, teacher shortages, and varying levels of teacher preparation in values-based pedagogical approaches, all of which constrain the capacity of educators to implement the more resource-intensive, relationally grounded pedagogical approaches associated with the ideal conception of Islamic education, such as sustained individual mentorship and experiential character formation.

Consequently, while the practical paradigm of Islamic Religious Education fulfills certain essential functions—ensuring baseline religious literacy and doctrinal knowledge among students—it frequently falls short of achieving the comprehensive, transformative character formation envisioned within the ideal conception, resulting in graduates who may possess adequate religious knowledge yet lack the deeper internalized values and ethical commitment that authentic Islamic education aspires to cultivate (Zahroh dkk., 2023).

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Identifying the Gap between Ideal and Practice

The disjunction between the ideal concept and practical paradigm of Islamic Religious Education manifests across several interconnected dimensions, each contributing to what scholars have termed the "implementation gap" within Islamic educational practice. This gap is not merely a matter of insufficient resources or administrative constraints but reflects deeper philosophical and structural tensions between the holistic aspirations of Islamic educational philosophy and the reductionist tendencies of modern standardized educational systems (Daheri, 2022).

One significant dimension of this gap concerns the disjunction between knowledge and practice (ilm and amal), wherein students may successfully acquire cognitive knowledge of religious teachings without corresponding internalization or behavioral application of these teachings in their daily lives. This phenomenon, sometimes described as "religious knowledge without religious character," represents a fundamental failure to achieve the integrative aspiration of Islamic education, wherein knowledge acquisition is meant to seamlessly translate into righteous conduct and character transformation (Komariah & Nihayah, 2023).

Another dimension concerns the temporal and structural gap between the intensive, relationally embedded educational approach idealized within classical Islamic pedagogy and the time-constrained, institutionally fragmented structure of contemporary formal schooling (Abdullah, 2022). Whereas traditional pesantren education often involved sustained, immersive engagement between teacher and student over extended periods, contemporary formal Islamic Religious Education is typically confined to brief weekly instructional periods, insufficient for the kind of deep relational mentorship and experiential learning that character formation genuinely requires.

A further dimension of the gap relates to assessment philosophy, wherein the comprehensive, multidimensional standard of success articulated within the ideal conception—encompassing faith, character, knowledge, and social contribution—is replaced within practical implementation by narrow, cognitively oriented examination metrics that fail to capture the deeper transformative outcomes that authentic Islamic education aims to achieve. This assessment gap creates perverse incentives, wherein institutions and teachers may prioritize examination preparation over genuine character formation, given the greater visibility and accountability associated with measurable examination outcomes (Efendi dkk., 2025).

This gap is further compounded by the broader secularizing and bureaucratic pressures of modern educational governance, which tend to favor standardization, measurability, and

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

administrative efficiency over the more personalized, contextually responsive, and difficult-to-measure outcomes associated with authentic character formation, creating systemic pressures that inadvertently work against the realization of the ideal conception of Islamic Religious Education within contemporary institutional contexts.

Curriculum Design and Pedagogical Challenges

Curriculum design represents a critical site of tension between the ideal and practical paradigms of Islamic Religious Education, as national curricular frameworks must balance the comprehensive aspirations of Islamic educational philosophy against practical constraints including instructional time, resource availability, and alignment with broader national educational standards and objectives (Saada & Magadlah, 2020).

Contemporary Islamic Religious Education curricula, particularly within Indonesia's national education system, are frequently criticized for their overemphasis on cognitive content coverage—encompassing Qur'anic recitation, doctrinal knowledge, and jurisprudential rulings—at the expense of affective and psychomotor learning objectives that are essential for genuine character formation (Suparjo & Hidayah, 2023). This curricular imbalance reflects broader tensions within educational policy between the desire for standardized, measurable learning outcomes and the recognition that authentic character formation requires more holistic, less easily quantifiable pedagogical approaches.

Pedagogical innovation within Islamic Religious Education faces additional challenges related to teacher preparation and professional development, as many educators receive limited training in contemporary pedagogical approaches—such as experiential learning, project-based instruction, and values clarification methodologies—that could help bridge the gap between doctrinal transmission and character internalization (Purwanto dkk., 2023). Without adequate professional development support, teachers often default to traditional lecture-based instructional approaches, even when curricular guidelines formally encourage more student-centered, experiential pedagogical strategies.

The integration of technology within Islamic Religious Education pedagogy presents both opportunities and challenges within this context. While digital tools and multimedia resources offer potential avenues for more engaging, interactive religious education, their effective integration requires both technological infrastructure and pedagogical expertise that many educational institutions, particularly in resource-limited contexts, may lack. Moreover, uncritical or poorly designed technological integration risks further reducing religious education to

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

superficial content delivery rather than genuine character formation.

Curriculum design challenges are further compounded by the need to balance universal Islamic educational principles with contextual relevance to students' diverse lived experiences, cultural backgrounds, and contemporary social realities. Curricula that fail to adequately contextualize religious teachings to students' actual lives risk fostering a disconnect between formal religious instruction and students' practical ethical decision-making, undermining the transformative potential that contextually responsive Islamic education could otherwise achieve (Saada & Magadlah, 2020).

Teacher Competence and Institutional Culture

The role of educators represents a pivotal factor in determining whether Islamic Religious Education successfully bridges the gap between ideal and practice, as teachers serve as the primary mediators between curricular content and students' lived educational experience. Teacher competence in this context encompasses not merely mastery of religious subject content but also pedagogical skill, exemplary personal character, and the capacity to model the very values that Islamic education seeks to instill.

Empirical literature on Islamic Religious Education frequently identifies teacher competence as a significant limiting factor in achieving the ideal conception of religious education, with many educators reporting inadequate pedagogical training, particularly in values-based and character-oriented instructional methodologies. This competence gap is often attributed to limitations within teacher education programs, which may emphasize content mastery over pedagogical innovation and character-modeling capacity (Purwanto dkk., 2023).

Institutional culture plays an equally critical role in shaping the practical realization of Islamic Religious Education, as the broader educational environment—including school leadership, peer culture, and institutional policies—significantly influences whether formal religious instruction is reinforced or undermined by the lived culture of the educational institution. Schools that cultivate a genuinely values-oriented institutional culture, wherein ethical conduct is consistently modeled and reinforced across all aspects of school life, are more likely to successfully bridge the gap between doctrinal instruction and character internalization than institutions where religious education remains isolated within formal classroom instruction alone.

The exemplary modeling function traditionally associated with religious educators—particularly within the pesantren tradition, where the kyai serves as a living embodiment of Islamic values—represents a critical pedagogical mechanism that is often difficult to replicate within the

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

more impersonal, bureaucratically structured environment of contemporary formal schooling. Restoring or approximating this exemplary modeling function within contemporary institutional contexts represents a significant challenge requiring sustained institutional commitment and teacher professional formation.

Addressing these competence and cultural gaps requires comprehensive investment in teacher professional development, encompassing not only pedagogical training but also opportunities for educators' own spiritual and character formation, recognizing that teachers' capacity to model and cultivate character in their students is fundamentally dependent on their own demonstrated character and spiritual maturity (Mala & Hunaida, 2023; Parhan dkk., 2024).

Islamic Religious Education within Pesantren and Higher Education Contexts

Pesantren-based educational institutions, including those affiliated with Nurul Jadid University, occupy a distinctive position within the broader discourse on Islamic Religious Education, as they represent institutional contexts specifically designed to approximate the ideal, holistic conception of Islamic education through sustained, immersive, community-based learning environments that extend well beyond formal classroom instruction.

Within the pesantren tradition, the integration of ideal and practical dimensions of Islamic education is facilitated through the comprehensive nature of the educational environment, wherein students (santri) engage in sustained daily interaction with kyai and ustadz, participate in communal religious practices, and are immersed within an institutional culture explicitly oriented toward character formation alongside academic instruction (Wahab, 2025). This immersive structure provides significantly greater opportunity for the experiential, relationally grounded character formation idealized within classical Islamic educational philosophy compared to conventional formal schooling contexts.

However, even within pesantren-based institutions, tensions between ideal and practical paradigms persist, particularly as these institutions increasingly incorporate formal academic curricula, standardized examinations, and modern institutional structures in response to broader educational policy requirements and societal expectations regarding formal credentialing. This integration of traditional pesantren pedagogy with modern formal educational structures requires careful institutional balancing to preserve the essential character-formation strengths of the pesantren model while meeting contemporary academic and credentialing expectations (Lubis & Pratami, 2026).

Islamic higher education institutions, including universities emerging from pesantren

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

traditions, face distinctive challenges in extending the holistic educational ideal into higher education contexts, where academic specialization, research productivity expectations, and professional preparation objectives may compete with the character-formation mission traditionally associated with pesantren education. Successfully integrating these potentially competing institutional priorities requires deliberate curricular and cultural strategies that explicitly embed character formation objectives within academic and professional preparation programs (Muthrofin dkk., 2025).

The experience of pesantren-based higher education institutions offers valuable insights for the broader discourse on bridging the gap between ideal and practical paradigms of Islamic Religious Education, demonstrating that meaningful integration is achievable when institutions maintain explicit, sustained institutional commitment to holistic character formation alongside academic excellence, supported by institutional structures—including residential communal living, sustained mentorship relationships, and integrated religious practice—that facilitate the kind of immersive, experiential learning environment necessary for genuine character internalization.

Toward an Integrative Paradigm: Bridging Ideal and Practice

Addressing the persistent gap between the ideal concept and practical paradigm of Islamic Religious Education requires the development of an integrative paradigm capable of reconciling theological and philosophical idealism with the practical realities and constraints of contemporary educational systems. Such an integrative approach must neither abandon the comprehensive, holistic aspirations of classical Islamic educational philosophy nor ignore the legitimate practical constraints—including limited instructional time, resource limitations, and standardized assessment requirements—that shape contemporary educational practice (Arifin, 2016).

One key strategy for bridging this gap involves curriculum reform that more deliberately integrates affective and psychomotor learning objectives alongside cognitive content, ensuring that character formation and experiential religious practice receive explicit curricular attention rather than being treated as incidental byproducts of cognitive instruction. This may involve the incorporation of service-learning components, reflective journaling practices, and structured opportunities for the practical application of religious teachings within students' daily lives.

Assessment reform represents another critical component of an integrative paradigm, requiring the development of more comprehensive evaluation frameworks capable of capturing character development and behavioral change alongside cognitive knowledge acquisition (Muis,

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

2025). This may involve portfolio-based assessment, teacher and peer observation of conduct, and community-based evaluation mechanisms that extend beyond traditional written examinations to capture the fuller range of outcomes that authentic Islamic education aims to achieve.

Teacher professional development constitutes a further essential strategy, requiring sustained investment in pedagogical training that equips educators with the skills necessary to implement experiential, values-based instructional approaches, alongside opportunities for teachers' own ongoing spiritual and character formation, recognizing that effective character education fundamentally depends on the exemplary conduct and pedagogical capacity of educators themselves (Syahrin & Widodo, 2025).

Institutional culture reform, encompassing school leadership commitment, peer culture cultivation, and the alignment of broader institutional practices with the values embedded within formal religious curricula, represents an essential complementary strategy, ensuring that formal religious instruction is reinforced rather than contradicted by the lived culture of the educational institution.

Ultimately, bridging the gap between ideal and practice requires sustained, coordinated institutional commitment across curricular, pedagogical, assessment, and cultural dimensions, recognizing that the realization of the comprehensive, transformative vision of Islamic Religious Education articulated within classical Islamic educational philosophy remains an ongoing aspirational project requiring continuous institutional reflection, innovation, and genuine commitment to holistic human development.

CONCLUSION

This study has examined the persistent tension between the ideal concept and practical paradigm of Islamic Religious Education, revealing a significant gap between the comprehensive, holistic vision articulated within classical Islamic educational philosophy and the more constrained, cognitively oriented implementation observed within contemporary formal educational practice. The ideal conception of Islamic Religious Education, rooted in the pursuit of insan kamil and the integration of knowledge, faith, and character, envisions education as a transformative process extending far beyond cognitive knowledge acquisition toward comprehensive spiritual, moral, and social development.

However, this study has demonstrated that the practical implementation of Islamic Religious Education within contemporary formal educational institutions frequently falls short of

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

this comprehensive ideal, constrained by curricular limitations, examination-oriented assessment paradigms, insufficient teacher preparation in values-based pedagogy, and broader institutional and bureaucratic pressures that favor standardization and measurable cognitive outcomes over the more holistic, difficult-to-quantify dimensions of character formation.

The gap between ideal and practice manifests across multiple interconnected dimensions, including the disjunction between religious knowledge and religious conduct, the temporal and structural limitations of formal instructional time relative to the immersive engagement required for genuine character formation, and the narrow assessment metrics that fail to capture the comprehensive developmental outcomes envisioned within Islamic educational philosophy.

Pesantren-based educational institutions, including those affiliated with Nurul Jadid University, offer valuable insights into how this gap might be more effectively bridged, demonstrating that the integration of ideal and practical dimensions of Islamic education is more readily achieved within immersive, community-based educational environments that extend character formation beyond formal classroom instruction into the broader lived experience of educational community life.

The study proposes an integrative paradigm as a strategic response to this persistent gap, encompassing curriculum reform that explicitly incorporates affective and psychomotor learning objectives, assessment reform that captures character development alongside cognitive knowledge, sustained investment in teacher professional development, and institutional culture reform that reinforces formal religious instruction through consistent institutional practice and exemplary modeling by educators and leadership.

This research contributes to the broader scholarly discourse on Islamic educational philosophy and practice by systematically identifying the specific dimensions of divergence between ideal and practical paradigms, offering a conceptual foundation for future empirical research examining the effectiveness of specific integrative strategies within diverse institutional contexts. Future studies employing field-based methodologies, including classroom observation, teacher and student interviews, and longitudinal assessment of character outcomes, would provide valuable empirical validation of the theoretical propositions advanced in this study.

Ultimately, realizing the comprehensive, transformative vision of Islamic Religious Education requires sustained institutional commitment, pedagogical innovation, and genuine dedication to holistic human development that honors both the intellectual rigor and profound moral-spiritual aspirations at the heart of the Islamic educational tradition, ensuring that future generations of learners are equipped not merely with religious knowledge but with the

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

internalized character and faith necessary to embody the ideal of insan kamil in their daily lives and social contributions.

REFERENCES

Abdullah, M. (2022). Islamic Religious Education Based on Religious Intersubjectivity: Philosophical Perspectives and Phenomenology of Religion. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam*. https://doi.org/10.14421/jpai.2022.191-11

Adnan, M. (2022). Islamic Education and Character Building in The 4.0 Industrial Revolution. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i1.1771

'Aini, R. A. N., & Zamroji, M. (2025). Integration of Religious Moderation Values in the Islamic Religious Education Learning. *Tarsib: Jurnal Program Studi PGMI*. https://doi.org/10.61181/tarsib.v2i2.504

Arifin, S. (2016). Islamic religious education and radicalism in Indonesia: Strategy of de-radicalization through strengthening the living values education. *Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies*, *6*, 93–126. https://doi.org/10.18326/ijims.v6i1.93-126

Bellerose, M., Rodriguez, M., & Vivier, P. (2022). A systematic review of the qualitative literature on barriers to high-quality prenatal and postpartum care among low-income women. *Health services research*. https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-6773.14008

Chumayroh, Cahyadi, A., Pengajaran, P., Pada, Y. E., Pendidikan, P., & Islam, A. (2025). Effective Teaching Approaches in Islamic Religious Education Learning. *JOURNAL OF DIGITAL LEARNING AND DISTANCE EDUCATION*. https://doi.org/10.56778/jdlde.v3i8.394

Daheri, M. (2022). Religious Moderation, Inclusive, and Global Citizenship as New Directions for Islamic Religious Education in Madrasah. *Nazhruna: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. https://doi.org/10.31538/nzh.v5i1.1853

Efendi, B., Susanto, H., Nuraini, Basri, M., & Samsuri, M. (2025). Integrating Islamic Religious Education for SDGs: A Systematic Literature Review and Bibliometric Study. *Profetika: Jurnal Studi Islam*. https://doi.org/10.23917/profetika.v26i02.11522

Hamid, N., & Wahyuni, S. (2024). A Multicultural Islamic Religious Education Curriculum Development. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. https://doi.org/10.38073/jpi.v14i2.1731

Hasra, R., Sah, Moh. A., Mashuri, S., & Ubadah, U. (2025). Avoiding Social Discord via Islamic Religious Education Rooted in Multiculturalism Islamic Religious Education. *Maharot : Journal of Islamic Education*. https://doi.org/10.28944/maharot.v9i1.2078

Hernawati, S., Hafizh, M., & Arya, M. N. F. (2024). Adjusting the Ideal Islamic Religious Education

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Curriculum to the Development of AI-Based Technology. *Progresiva : Jurnal Pemikiran dan Pendidikan Islam*. https://doi.org/10.22219/progresiva.v13i01.32931

Komariah, N., & Nihayah, I. (2023). Improving The Personality Character of Students Through Learning Islamic Religious Education. *At-tadzkir: Islamic Education Journal*. https://doi.org/10.59373/attadzkir.v2i1.15

Lubis, W. A., & Pratami, F. (2026). Toward Holistic Assessment in Adult Islamic Religious Education: Integrating Irfani Epistemology and Andragogy. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*. https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v18i1.8950

Mahdiyyah, R., & Jasminto, J. (2025). Implementation Of The Concept Of Religious Moderation In Islamic Religious Education For Students. *Urwatul Wutsqo: Jurnal Studi Kependidikan dan Keislaman*. https://doi.org/10.54437/urwatulwutsqo.v14i1.2226

Mala, A., & Hunaida, W. L. (2023). Exploring the Role of Religious Moderation in Islamic Education: A Comprehensive Analysis of Its Unifying Potential and Practical Applications. *Jurnal Pendidikan Agama Islam (Journal of Islamic Education Studies)*. https://doi.org/10.15642/jpai.2023.11.2.173-196

Muis, Abd. (2025). Incorporating religious moderation values into the Islamic religious education curriculum in secondary education: A systematic review of goals, experiences, methods, and evaluation. *British Journal of Religious Education*, *48*, 248–262. https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2025.2598619

Muthrofin, K., Ikmal, H., & Wahyudi, W. (2025). The Implementation of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) in Shaping the Profile of Rahmatan lil alamin Students in a Madrasah. *EDUCATIO : Journal of Education*. https://doi.org/10.29138/educatio.v8i2.1182

Parhan, M., Syahidin, S., Somad, M., Abdulah, M., & Nugraha, R. H. (2024). Developing a Contextual Learning Model in Islamic Education to Improve Applicable Knowledge and Foster Knowledge-Based Virtues. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v10i1.35205

Pr, S., Aryati, A., Yenni, T., Putri, S., Yanuarti, E., & Ahmal, A. (2023). Implementation of Humanistic Learning Theory in Islamic Religious Education Learning. *AL-ISHLAH: Jurnal Pendidikan*. https://doi.org/10.35445/alishlah.v15i2.2211

Purwanto, Y., Saepudin, A., & Sofaussamawati, S. (2023). The Development of Reflective Practices for Islamic Religious Education Teachers. *Jurnal Pendidikan Islam*. https://doi.org/10.15575/jpi.v0i0.24155

Ruiz-Eugenio, L., Valls-Carol, R., Flecha, A., & Aubert, A. (2024). A systematic literature review and

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

case study on the social impact of the other women's contributions to education and dialogic feminism. *Frontiers in Sociology*, *9*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fsoc.2024.1477983

Saada, N. (2023). Educating for global citizenship in religious education: Islamic perspective. *International Journal of Educational Development*. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2023.102894

Saada, N., & Magadlah, H. (2020). The meanings and possible implications of critical Islamic religious education. *British Journal of Religious Education*, *43*, 206–217. https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2020.1785844

Sijamhodžić-Nadarević, D. (2023). Contribution of Islamic Religious Education to Intercultural Values in Pluralistic European Cultures: Insights from Bosnia and Herzegovina. *Religions*.

Suparjo, S., & Hidayah, L. N. (2023). Islamic Religious Education in Indonesia: Understanding the Urgency and Paradigm Shift from a Societal Perspective. *International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research and Analysis*. https://doi.org/10.47191/ijmra/v6-i6-08

Syahrin, M., & Widodo, W. (2025). THE TRANSFORMATION OF ISLAMIC RELIGIOUS EDUCATION IN THE FACE OF RELIGIOUS MODERATION IN THE DIGITAL ERA. *JURNAL PEDAGOGY*. https://doi.org/10.63889/pedagogy.v18i1.246

Tadas, S., & Coyle, D. (2020). Barriers to and Facilitators of Technology in Cardiac Rehabilitation and Self-Management: Systematic Qualitative Grounded Theory Review. *Journal of Medical Internet Research*, *22*. https://doi.org/10.2196/preprints.18025

Ulfat, F. (2020). Empirical research: Challenges and impulses for Islamic religious education. *British Journal of Religious Education*, *42*, 415–423. https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2020.1711513

Wahab, A. (2025). The Concept of Religious Moderation in Islamic Education: A Study of the Thought of Contemporary Ulama. *ANWARUL*. https://doi.org/10.58578/anwarul.v5i4.7284

Wulandari, D., & Mafariech, M. (2025). Implementation of Humanistic Theory Concepts in Islamic Religious Education. *SCHOOLAR: Social and Literature Study in Education*. https://doi.org/10.32764/schoolar.v4i3.5584

Zahroh, U., Hamami, T., & Bahri, S. (2023). Integrative-Interconnective Model: Implementation in Islamic Religious Education Curriculum Development in Muhammadiyah Schools. *International Journal of Social Service and Research*. https://doi.org/10.46799/ijssr.v3i2.278

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License