International Journal of Education, Vocational and Social Science
https://e-journal.citakonsulindo.or.id/index.php/IJEVSS
E-ISSN : 2963 4954
IJEVSS

The Effectiveness of a Behavior Modification Model in Motivating Grade VIII-B Students to Improve Islamic Religious Education (PAI) Learning Outcomes at SMPN 12 Bengkulu City

Aisyah Gempita Lestari
Fatmawati Sukarno State Islamic University Bengkulu
Aisyahgempitalestari03@gmail.com
Mawardi Lubis
Fatmawati Sukarno State Islamic University Bengkulu
mawardilubis@mail.uinfasbengkulu.ac.id
Pasmah Chandra
Fatmawati Sukarno State Islamic University Bengkulu
pasmah@iainbengkulu.ac.id

Abstract

This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of behavior modification models in motivating students to improve Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning outcomes among Grade VIII B students at SMP Negeri 12 Kota Bengkulu. The study employed a mixed-method approach using quantitative and qualitative data. Quantitative data were obtained from questionnaires administered to 26 students, while qualitative data were collected through observation, interviews with the PAI teacher and six purposively selected students, and documentation. The questionnaire consisted of 35 items covering behavior modification effectiveness, student motivation, and learning outcomes. The validity test produced 21 valid items and 14 invalid items, while reliability testing produced a Cronbach's Alpha coefficient of 0.858. Hypothesis testing using a paired sample t-test resulted in t = -9.298, df = 25, with Sig. (2-tailed) = 0.000 < 0.05. This indicates a statistically significant difference between students' learning outcomes before and after the implementation of the behavior modification model. Qualitative findings reinforced the quantitative results: mastery learning, direct instruction, simulation, social learning, positive feedback, rewards, worship practices, discussion, and teacher guidance encouraged students' participation, confidence, motivation, and understanding. Therefore, the behavior modification model was effective in PAI learning for Grade VIII B students at SMPN 12 Kota Bengkulu.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Keywords: Behavior Modification Model, Learning Motivation, Learning Outcomes, Islamic Religious Education, SMPN 12 Kota Bengkulu.

INTRODUCTION

National education is directed toward developing the potential of learners so that they become individuals who possess faith and piety, knowledge, good character, health, independence, creativity, competence, democratic values, and a sense of responsibility. In the context of Islamic education, Islamic Religious Education (PAI) is oriented not only toward the mastery of religious knowledge but also toward the cultivation of faith, the internalization of values, and the practical application of Islamic teachings in the learners' lives. Therefore, the success of PAI instruction is heavily influenced by the quality of interaction among the teacher, the learners, the instructional strategies, the environment, and the forms of reinforcement provided during the learning process.

At its core, learning is an interactive process that demands active student involvement. The teacher functions as a source of information, a facilitator, a guide, and a manager of the learning process; students should not merely be cast as passive recipients of information. Teacher explanations alone are insufficient to develop students' abilities optimally. Consequently, teachers must select instructional strategies and models that align with the learners' characteristics and the learning objectives. (Priansa, 2019).

Learning effectiveness can be gauged by the extent to which established objectives are achieved. Effective instruction provides opportunities for both teachers and students to analyze, explore, practice, and evaluate the learning material. Effectiveness also entails the appropriate utilization of time, resources, methods, and facilities to bring about the desired changes in students' knowledge, attitudes, and skills. (Widiawati & Jamaludin, 2023; Rahmawati & Suryadi, 2019).

One approach relevant to these needs is behavior modification. Behavior modification is a method of behavioral change based on learning principles, aimed at increasing adaptive behaviors and reducing maladaptive ones. From a behaviorist perspective, the learning environment can be structured to encourage desired responses through reinforcement and to diminish inappropriate responses. The principle of operant conditioning positions reinforcement as a means to increase the frequency of desired behaviors, while punishment serves as a method to reduce undesired behaviors. (Purwanta, 2005; Bustamam, 2024).

In this study, the behavior modification model is understood through several forms of

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

learning: mastery learning, direct instruction, simulation, and social learning. Mastery learning emphasizes the mastery of material before students move on to the next topic. Direct instruction provides systematic guidance and supervision. Simulation offers experience through practice and role-playing, while social learning enables students to learn through observation, interaction, and collaboration with peers. These four forms are relevant to Islamic Religious Education (PAI) because the subject matter requires not only theoretical understanding but also practical application.

Motivation is a crucial factor in the learning process. It serves as a driving force that compels students to strive toward their goals. Motivation can originate from within the student or from the environment through rewards, praise, competition, and support from teachers and family. When students are motivated, they tend to be more diligent in completing tasks, more persistent in facing challenges, and more active in seeking solutions. Ultimately, these conditions have the potential to improve learning outcomes. (Priansa, 2019; Saefullah, 2019)

Learning outcomes refer to the capabilities students acquire after participating in the learning process. These outcomes encompass cognitive, affective, and psychomotor aspects. In PAI, learning outcomes are evident in a student's ability to understand religious material, demonstrate good attitudes and character, and practice acts of worship such as *wudu* (ablution), *salat* (prayer), and Quranic recitation. Consequently, PAI learning outcomes should be viewed comprehensively, rather than solely through academic grades. (Priansa, 2019).

Preliminary observations conducted by the researcher at SMP Negeri 12 Bengkulu City in October 2023 revealed issues regarding Islamic Religious Education (PAI) instruction in class VIII B. Interviews with the PAI teacher and observations of 26 students identified several problems: poor communication skills, low learning motivation, a lack of discipline in completing assignments, passive attitudes, frequent seat-switching, and instances of students leaving the classroom. These conditions negatively impacted PAI learning outcomes and highlighted the need to evaluate the behavior modification model previously implemented by the teacher.

Previous studies cited in the manuscript indicate that behavior modification models have been used to improve learning outcomes in Physics, demonstrating significant differences in results before and after the model's implementation. Other research has examined motivation as a determinant of learning outcomes, the factors contributing to poor performance, and strategies to enhance student achievement. However, research specifically investigating the effectiveness of behavior modification models in PAI instruction by combining quantitative evidence with qualitative analysis within the context of class VIII B at SMPN 12 Bengkulu City remains limited.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

This research addresses that gap. (Rafiqah, Suhardiman, & Fauziah, 2021; Serin, 2023; Andriani, 2019; Nabillah & Abadi, 2019)

Based on this background, the research problem is defined as the effectiveness of a behavior modification model in motivating students to improve their PAI learning outcomes. The study aims to determine the effectiveness of this model among class VIII B students at SMPN 12 Bengkulu City.

RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study employs a mixed-methods approach, integrating quantitative and qualitative data. The thesis identifies the design as "Sequential Exploratory," utilizing quantitative data as the primary source, reinforced by qualitative data. To ensure consistency within the article, the study is presented as mixed-methods research, with quantitative data serving as the basis for testing effectiveness and qualitative data supporting the interpretation of results. This combined approach was selected to yield comprehensive findings capable of explaining not only whether changes occurred but also how the model was implemented during instruction (Sugiyono, 2019; Creswell, 2014).

The research was conducted at SMP Negeri 12 Bengkulu City (located at Jalan Kuala Lempuing No. 10, Lempuing Urban Village, Ratu Agung District, Bengkulu City) in September 2024. The study population consisted of 26 students from class VIII B. Given the relatively small population size, the entire group was included in the sample using a total sampling (or saturated sampling) technique. For the qualitative component, six students were purposively selected based on variations in motivation and learning outcomes. Interviews were also conducted with the Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teacher, who served as the key informant (Sugiyono, 2013; Arikunto, 2010).

The research variables comprise the effectiveness of the behavior modification model (X1), student motivation (X2), and PAI learning outcomes (Y). The quantitative instrument consisted of a closed-ended questionnaire containing 35 items: 20 items regarding the effectiveness of the behavior modification model, 10 items regarding motivation, and 5 items regarding learning outcomes. Indicators for the behavior modification model included mastery learning, direct instruction, simulation, and social learning; motivation indicators covered intrinsic and extrinsic factors; and learning outcomes focused on academic aspects. The questionnaire utilized a Likert scale with the following response options: strongly agree, agree, somewhat disagree, and disagree.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Qualitative data were obtained through observation, interviews, and documentation. Observation was used to directly observe the learning process and student behavior. Interviews were conducted with the Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teacher and six students to gather information regarding the implementation of mastery learning, direct instruction, simulation, social learning, intrinsic and extrinsic motivation, and learning outcomes. Documentation was used to supplement data on school conditions and research activities. (Pratiwi et al., 2024; Moleong, 2010)

Quantitative data analysis was performed using SPSS version 27. Validity testing was conducted using the Pearson Product Moment correlation by comparing the calculated r-value (r-count) with the table r-value (r-table) at a 5% significance level; the r-table value used in this study was 0.388. Reliability testing utilized Cronbach's Alpha. Subsequently, hypothesis testing was carried out using a paired-sample t-test to compare pre-test and post-test results. Qualitative data were analyzed through data reduction, data display, and conclusion drawing/verification, following the Miles and Huberman model adopted in this study. (Widoyoko, 2009; Priyatno, 2016)

The effectiveness criteria used in this study were: highly effective (76–100%), effective (51–75%), less effective (26–50%), and ineffective (1–25%). The research hypotheses consisted of H0: there is no significant effectiveness of the behavior modification model in motivating students to improve PAI learning outcomes; and Ha: there is significant effectiveness.

RESEARCH RESULTS

A. Initial Learning Conditions

Preliminary observations indicated that Class VIII B faced several behavioral and motivational issues. Students tended to be passive and unfocused; they would talk to classmates during lessons, fail to complete assignments, change seats, and leave the classroom. These conditions provided a compelling reason to evaluate the behavior modification model employed by the Islamic Religious Education (PAI) teacher.

During the research implementation, the PAI teacher did not merely deliver subject matter but also provided guidance, set an example, and facilitated exercises, practical activities, feedback, and rewards. The teacher integrated the material with daily life and offered extra attention to students experiencing difficulties. This demonstrates that behavior modification was implemented through positive reinforcement, mentoring, practice, and supervision.

B. Validity and Reliability Test Results

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Validity testing was conducted on 35 instrument items. The results showed that 21 items were valid, while 14 were discarded. Regarding the behavior modification model effectiveness variable, 12 out of 20 items were deemed valid; for the motivation variable, 5 out of 10 items were valid; and for the learning outcomes variable, 4 out of 5 items were valid.

Variable	Number of Items	Valid	Not Valid
Effectiveness of the Behavior Modification Model (X1)	20	12	8
Student Motivation (X2)	10	5	5
Learning Outcomes (Y)	5	4	1
Total	35	21	14

Reliability testing using Cronbach's Alpha yielded a coefficient of 0.858 for the 21 valid items. This value exceeds the reliability threshold used in the study, indicating that the instrument possesses very high internal consistency.

C. Hypothesis Test Results

The paired-sample t-test yielded a t-value of -9.298, degrees of freedom (df) of 25, and a Sig. (2-tailed) value of 0.000. Since this significance value is less than 0.05, H0 is rejected and Ha is accepted.

Data Pairs	Mean Difference	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
Pre-test – Post-test	-3,65296	-9,298	25	0,000

The results indicate a significant difference between learning outcomes before and after the implementation of the behavior modification model. The negative sign on the t-value arises because the calculation was performed as pre-test minus post-test; thus, the direction of the difference indicates that scores following the intervention were higher than those prior to it. These findings provide statistical evidence that the behavior modification model is effective in improving Islamic Religious Education (PAI) learning outcomes in the class under study.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

D. Qualitative Findings: Implementation of the Behavior Modification Model

1. Mastery Learning

Teachers explained that mastery learning is implemented by ensuring students understand the material before moving on to the next topic. Teachers utilize group discussions, project-based learning, formative assessments, feedback, and remedial sessions. Students also described having opportunities to review, practice, ask questions, and engage in discussions until they grasped the material. Some students stated that this approach boosted their confidence, as they did not feel left behind when new material was introduced.

These findings indicate that mastery learning serves as a form of continuous reinforcement. Students have the opportunity to correct errors, while teachers gain insight into concepts that have not yet been mastered. In the context of Islamic Religious Education (PAI), this approach is significant because the mastery of conceptual material must go hand-in-hand with the ability to apply religious values.

2. Direct Instruction

Direct instruction is implemented through explanations, guidance, practice, discussions, and immediate feedback. Teachers state that practicing prayer, Quran recitation, and religious activities becomes more effective when students receive direct examples and guidance. Students report that teacher guidance and feedback help them understand the material, identify errors, and boost their enthusiasm for learning.

Direct instruction also influences student-to-student interaction. Students report being more active in discussions, helping peers, and feeling confident enough to express their opinions. Reinforcement in the form of praise and recognition encourages students to maintain positive behavior.

3. Simulation

Simulations are implemented using real-life scenarios related to acts of worship and social behavior. Teachers assign specific roles such as imam or muezzin provide guidance, and offer feedback during the practice sessions. Students state that role-playing and hands-on practice make Islamic Religious Education (PAI) concepts easier to grasp, as they can visualize and experience the practical application of these concepts.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

4. Social Learning

Social learning takes place through group discussions, presentations, collaboration, and the observation of peers' behavior. Teachers employ direct observation and personal communication to identify students who require support in social aspects. Success in social learning is assessed based on the quality of collaboration, communication, respect for differing opinions, tolerance, and empathy.

Students report that discussions and group work help them understand the material from diverse perspectives. They also become more open-minded, patient, and capable of listening, while developing a willingness to assist their peers. Thus, social learning not only supports academic achievement but also fosters social behaviors aligned with PAI values.

In social behavior simulations, students practice resolving conflicts, respecting peers, helping others, and applying Islamic values. Teacher recognition and praise serve as reinforcement, making students feel valued and more motivated.

E. Qualitative Findings: Student Motivation

Intrinsic motivation is evident in the sense of pride students feel when successfully grasping material without assistance, the desire to master religious subject matter, and the satisfaction derived from correctly performing religious practices. Students reported that successfully understanding material independently boosted their confidence and encouraged them to tackle more challenging topics.

Extrinsic motivation manifests through rewards, praise, bonus points, certificates, competitions, and support from both teachers and parents. Students indicated that rewards increased their enthusiasm for learning, fostered active participation in discussions, and improved their focus on tasks. However, interview findings also revealed that some students actively maintained their motivation through setting learning goals, establishing study schedules, and collaborating with peers, ensuring their motivation did not rely solely on rewards, he role of the teacher is crucial. Teachers provide positive feedback, individual attention, remedial support, and additional guidance, while also connecting Islamic Religious Education (PAI) material to daily life. Family support is also viewed as a factor that helps sustain motivation.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

F. Qualitative Findings: PAI Learning Outcomes

Teachers assess students' academic abilities through exam results, error analysis, and comparisons with previous performance. For students with low achievement, teachers provide extra attention, additional guidance, and recognition of even minor progress. Practical activities such as wudu (ablution), salat (prayer), and Quranic recitation are integrated into instruction, enabling students to connect theoretical knowledge with religious practice.

Students reported that engaging in acts of worship helped them grasp PAI material in a more concrete way. Understanding the physical movements, recitations, and underlying meanings of these acts of worship facilitated their mastery of the theory. Thus, PAI learning outcomes in this study appear to be a combination of academic understanding, attitudes, and practical skills.

DISCUSSION

The research results demonstrate that the behavior modification model is effective in improving learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education (PAI). Key evidence comes from the paired-sample t-test, which yielded a significance value (Sig.) of 0.000 ($p < 0.05$). These findings align with conclusions from previous studies cited in the manuscript specifically the research by Rafiqah, Suhardiman, and Fauziah which showed differences in learning outcomes before and after implementing a behavior modification model in Physics instruction. The commonality lies in the use of behavior change principles to enhance student engagement, while the current study extends this context to PAI instruction (Rafiqah, Suhardiman, & Fauziah, 2021).

Theoretically, the results can be explained through behaviorist principles, which posit that behavior is shaped by the relationship between stimulus, response, and reinforcement. In PAI instruction, stimuli may take the form of teacher directives, assignments, behavioral examples, practice sessions, and classroom rules. Responses are demonstrated through participation, task completion, discussion, the practice of acts of worship, and social behavior. Reinforcement is provided through praise, rewards, feedback, and additional attention. This sequence helps sustain desired learning behaviors (Priansa, 2019; Bustamam, 2024).

Mastery learning serves as a crucial component, as it offers students the opportunity to achieve material mastery incrementally. When students comprehend a topic before progressing to the next, their self-confidence increases. This aligns with interview findings indicating that students felt better prepared to tackle new material and more confident in asking questions when

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

they did not yet understand a concept.

Direct instruction provides a clear structure. In PAI, such structure is particularly important for topics requiring examples and practical application. Students do not merely receive explanations regarding the procedures of worship; they observe examples, attempt the actions, receive corrections, and repeat the practice. This pattern reinforces skills while fostering a more meaningful learning experience.

Simulations reinforce learning because students learn through experience. Role-playing and the practice of social behaviors ensure that the values of Islamic Religious Education (PAI) extend beyond mere declarative knowledge. Students can test interaction methods, experience the consequences of their behavior, and receive feedback. These findings support the notion that learning outcomes encompass cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains.

Social learning also plays a significant role, as students gain examples from both teachers and peers. When students observe classmates participating, helping others, or receiving praise for positive behavior, they are encouraged to emulate those actions. This process aligns with social learning concepts that emphasize observation, modeling, and environmental influences on behavior.

In terms of motivation, rewards and feedback serve as extrinsic reinforcement, whereas successfully grasping the material, feeling a sense of pride, and desiring to deepen one's understanding of religious teachings indicate the emergence of intrinsic motivation. The motivational theories discussed in the text position the needs for esteem and self-actualization as human needs capable of driving behavior. In this study, rewards do not stand alone but are integrated with guidance and opportunities for success. (Andriani, 2019; Priansa, 2019)

Research findings also highlight the crucial role of the teacher. Teachers act as planners, implementers, managers, evaluators, motivators, and guides. Rather than simply correcting errors, teachers strive to understand the reasons behind a student's failure to complete assignments, provide additional support, and establish communication with parents. This approach renders behavior modification educational and supportive, rather than merely punitive. (Musanna, 2023; Priansa, 2019)

Research findings indicate that the application of a behavior modification model in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) is effective when implemented consistently and in an integrated manner. Positive reinforcement, training, feedback, practice, and group work must be aligned with learning objectives. The model should not be viewed merely as the administration of rewards or punishments, but rather as the management of the learning environment to cultivate study

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

habits and behaviors that facilitate the achievement of goals (Rafiqah, Suhardiman, & Fauziah, 2021).

This study has limitations. The quantitative sample consisted of only 26 students from a single class; consequently, the results cannot be broadly generalized without further research. Qualitative data were derived from the teacher and six students, serving primarily to provide depth and explanation regarding the quantitative findings. Furthermore, this article presents the statistical results exactly as they appear in the original thesis, without reconstructing raw data that was unavailable in the document.

CONCLUSION

This study demonstrates that the behavior modification model is effective in motivating students to improve their learning outcomes in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) for class VIII B at SMPN 12 Bengkulu City. Quantitatively, 21 out of 35 instrument items were validated, and the instrument achieved a Cronbach's Alpha reliability coefficient of 0.858. The paired sample t-test yielded a t-value of -9.298 (df = 25) and a Sig. (2-tailed) value of 0.000 (< 0.05), indicating a significant difference in learning outcomes before and after the model's implementation.

Qualitatively, this effectiveness was supported by the application of mastery learning, direct instruction, simulations, and social learning. The teacher employed positive reinforcement, feedback, praise, rewards, remedial sessions, worship practices, discussions, and individual guidance. Students demonstrated improvements in self-confidence, active participation, social engagement, motivation, and understanding of the PAI material. Intrinsic motivation developed through success and self-confidence, while extrinsic motivation was reinforced through rewards, competition, and support from both teachers and parents.

Thus, the behavior modification model serves as a viable alternative instructional strategy for PAI, provided it is implemented in a focused and consistent manner and accompanied by evaluation. Teachers are advised to maintain positive reinforcement, offer remedial opportunities, integrate worship practices, and utilize discussions and simulations to ensure sustained behavioral change and improved learning outcomes.

REFERENCES

Abu Ahmadi, Widodo Supriyono. Psychology of Learning. Jakarta: PT Rineka Cipta, 2013.

Andriani, Rike. Learning Motivation as a Determinant of Student Learning Outcomes." 4, no. 1 (2019)

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Arikunto, Suharsimi. Research Procedures. Jakarta: Bulan Bintang, 1989.
Arikunto, Suharsimi. Research Procedures: A Practical Approach. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2010.
Arikunto, Suharsimi. Research Procedures: A Practical Approach, 13th Edition. Jakarta: Rineka Putra, 2013.
Bustamam, Mutia. An Overview of Skinner's Method in Early Childhood Behavior Formation at Raudhatul Ula Kindergarten, East Aceh. Jurnal Seumubeuet, 2024.
Creswell, John W. Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, 2014.
https://doi.org/10.17509/jpm.v4i1.14954.
https://doi.org/10.17509/jpm.v4i1.14958.
Majid, Abdul. Learning and Instruction. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 2014.
Moleong, Lexy J. Qualitative Research Methodology. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya, 2010.
Musanna, AhmadDuties, Roles, and Functions of Teachers in.... 6 (2023)
Nabillah, Tasya, and Agung Prasetyo Abadi. Factors Causing Low Student Learning Outcomes. 2019.
Nurliani, Nina, Herman Subarjah, and Atep Sujana. The Influence of the Problem-Based Learning Model on Student Learning Outcomes regarding Natural Events. 1, no. 1 (2016)
Pratiwi, Putri Adinda, Fahima Mashalani, Maulia Hafizhah, and Azra Batrisyia. "Uncovering Effective Observation Methods According to Pre-service EFL Teachers." 2, no. 1 (2024).
Priansa, Donni Juni. Development of Learning Strategies and Models. Bandung: CV Pustaka Setia, 2019.
Priyatno, Duwi. SPSS Handbook: Data Analysis, Data Processing & Statistical Case Resolution. Yogyakarta: Mediakom, 2016.
Purwanta, Edi. Behavior Modification: An Alternative Approach to Handling Children with Special Needs. Jakarta: Ministry of National Education, 2005.
Rafiqah, Rafiqah, Suhardiman Suhardiman, and Fauziah Fauziah. "The Effectiveness of Implementing a Behavior Modification Model on Improving Students' Physics Learning Outcomes." Al-Khazini: Journal of Physics Education 1, no. 1 (2021).
Rahmawati, Mega, and Edi Suryadi. "Teachers as Facilitators and Student Learning Effectiveness." Journal of Office Management Education 4, no. 1 (2019)
Riduwan. Methods and Techniques for Compiling a Thesis. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2013.
Ridwan. Fundamentals of Statistics. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2010.
Saefullah. Developmental and Educational Psychology. Bandung: CV Pustaka Setia, 2019.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Serin, Fattara Diwa. “Efforts to Improve Student Learning Achievement.” Journal on Education 6, no. 1 (2023). https://doi.org/10.31004/joe.v6i1.3497.

Siregar, Halimah Tusaddiyah. “Factors Influencing Learning Outcomes in Islamic Religious Education (PAI) Instruction.” 2, no. 2 (2024)

Sugiyono. Educational Research Methods. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2019.

Sugiyono. Mixed Research Methods. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2019.

Sugiyono. Quantitative, Qualitative, and R&D Research Methods. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2013.

Sugiyono. Quantitative, Qualitative, and R&D Research Methods. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2009.

Surachim, Ahim. Effectiveness of Dual System Education Learning Patterns. Bandung: Alfabeta, 2016.

Suwandi, Basrowi. Understanding Qualitative Research. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta, 2008.

Syofian Siregar. Quantitative Research Methods: Featuring Comparisons of Manual Calculations & SPSS. Jakarta: Kencana, 2015.

Widiawati, Widiawati, and Gilang Maulana Jamaludin. “Effectiveness of Multicultural-Based Learning for Elementary School Students.” Proceedings of the Postgraduate National Seminar 2, no. 1 (2023)

Widoyoko, Eko Putro. Learning Program Evaluation. Yogyakarta: Student Library, 2009.

Zainal, Khalim. "Understanding Problematic Adolescent Behavior from the Perspective of Behavioral, Humanistic, Psychoanalytic & Personality Theory." Journal of General Studies 9 (2008)

Zuriah, Nurul. Social and Educational Research Methodology. Jakarta: Bumi Aksara, 2002.

Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License