International Journal of Education, Vocational and Social Science
https://e-journal.citakonsulindo.or.id/index.php/IJEVSS
E-ISSN : 2963 4954
IJEVSS

# Electoral Dynamics of Islamic Parties in West Sumatra: A Comparative Analysis of the 2019 and 2024 Elections

**Fauzan Haviz**
Pascasarjana UIN Sjech M. Djamil Djambek Bukittinggi, Indonesia

Email: fauzanhaviz@gmail.com

**Abstrak**

*This article examines the electoral paradox of West Sumatra, namely indications of continued or strengthening support for Islamic parties amidst national trends that indicate electoral stagnation and challenges for Islamic-based parties in the 2019 and 2024 elections. This article develops an analytical framework to explain why local political dynamics do not always follow national trends. The study focuses on the interaction between Minangkabau political culture and the philosophy of Adat Basandi Syarak, Syarak Basandi Kitabullah (ABS-SBK), religious identity, socio-religious networks, the role of ulama and local elites, party institutional capacity, candidate quality, and communication and electoral mobilization strategies. The article uses a mixed methods design with a sequential explanatory pattern and a longitudinal comparison of the two elections. The quantitative stage is designed to compare the number and percentage of votes for Islamic parties at the national and West Sumatra levels, including variations between electoral districts. The qualitative stage is designed to explain social and political mechanisms that cannot be explained solely through changes in vote numbers. Data are sourced from official election documents, party documents, academic literature, observations, and in-depth interviews with relevant informants. The perspective of Islamic jurisprudence (fiqh siyasah) is used as an interpretive lens to discuss the ethics of representation, public interest (maslahah), trustworthiness (amanah), deliberation, and political responsibility without replacing empirical evidence. This article emphasizes the importance of distinguishing symbolic identity from the concrete mechanisms of political choice formation, as well as the need for systematic examination of cultural relationships, networks, candidates, organizations, and the context of competition.*

**Keywords: Electoral Paradox; Islamic Party; West Sumatra; Voting Behavior; ABS-SBK; Fiqh**



Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

**Siyasah.**

## INTRODUCTION

Elections are the primary mechanism of representative democracy, enabling citizens to express their political preferences, grant mandates to representatives, and periodically evaluate their power. However, election results reflect more than just competition between candidates or the organizational capabilities of parties. They also capture the complex relationships between social structures, collective identities, political experiences, perceptions of performance, and mobilization strategies. Therefore, changes in vote share must be interpreted as a phenomenon with both quantitative and social dimensions. While vote counts reveal the final outcome of the competition, explaining why voters make a particular choice requires examining the context and mechanisms underlying those results.

In post-Reformasi Indonesian politics, Islamic-based parties compete within an open and increasingly competitive multiparty system. Islamic parties face the challenge of transforming ideological and symbolic affinity into stable electoral support. On the one hand, Islamic identity remains a source of social and political orientation for some citizens. On the other hand, voters also consider candidates' abilities, track records, programs, access to resources, leadership image, and welfare issues (Fauzan, 2022). Thus, religion cannot be treated as a single factor that automatically determines choice, just as pragmatism cannot be assumed to eliminate the influence of religious identity entirely.

This article highlights the differences between national trends and the West Sumatran context. At the national level, Islamic parties are depicted as facing stagnation or declining support across several electoral indicators. Meanwhile, West Sumatra is positioned as a region showing continuity, and even indications of strengthening support, for Islamic parties in the 2019 and 2024 elections. This divergence creates an electoral paradox: local conditions do not seem to fully align with common explanations that emphasize the personalization of politics, the rationalization of choice, and the increasing competitiveness of nationalist parties (Haviz & Yakub, 2025).

Claims about this paradox need to be placed within careful methodological boundaries. The term "strengthening" should not be based solely on general impressions or the success of a particular party in a particular electoral district. It must be substantiated through establishing an operational definition of Islamic parties, establishing consistent indicators, and comparing official data between two election periods. Changes in the number of votes, percentage of votes, number of seats, and relative position of parties are distinct indicators and do not always move in the same


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

direction. Increases in the number of votes can occur due to an increase in voters, while changes in percentages can be influenced by changes in votes for other parties or turnout levels (Tanjung dkk., 2023). Therefore, this article positions the paradoxical claim as a research problem that needs to be tested, not as a final, proven result.

The West Sumatran context makes this issue crucial. In Minangkabau society, the Adat Basandi Syarak, Syarak Basandi Kitabullah (ABS-SBK) philosophy is often understood as a marker of the connection between custom and Islam. This philosophy provides the context for the formation of collective identity, moral authority, social practices, and a public language of propriety. However, cultural values do not operate as a uniform, direct cause. Their meaning can be interpreted differently by social groups, generations, regions, organizations, and political actors. The relationship between cultural values and electoral choices must therefore be explained through concrete social and political intermediaries.

The central question is not simply whether West Sumatran society is religious or whether Islamic parties have strong support. More analytical questions are the mechanisms through which local religious and cultural identities are transformed into voting considerations, how socio-religious networks build trust or disseminate political information, how party organizations connect community aspirations with candidates, and when these factors outweigh performance considerations or economic interests (Tanjung dkk., 2023). This shifts attention from essentialist explanations of regional character to empirically testable explanations.

This article has three objectives. First, it formulates comparative questions regarding the dynamics of Islamic party votes in the 2019 and 2024 elections at the national and West Sumatra levels. Second, it develops an explanatory framework that integrates sociocultural factors, religious identity, social networks, party institutions, candidates, and electoral strategies. Third, it describes a methodological design that can be used to assess the relationships between these factors and interpret their relevance from the perspective of Islamic studies and Islamic jurisprudence. These objectives are analytical and methodological; this article does not claim to have completed the planned field data collection.

The importance of this research lies in avoiding overly broad national generalizations. National aggregate trends can mask subnational variations, while prominent local cases can highlight the boundary conditions for a theory. If voting behavior in West Sumatra differs from expected patterns, this difference does not necessarily invalidate the general theory. Rather, the case can help clarify the conditions under which identity, networks, organizations, or candidates play a stronger role. In other words, West Sumatra can be a useful case for testing the scope of


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

theories of voting behavior and understanding how general factors operate in local contexts (Harza, 2023).

The article structure follows the format of a scientific article in the template file: introduction, conceptual review, discussion of the analytical framework, research methods, discussion, conclusions, further research directions, and references. Adjustments are made to align the structure with the nature of the primary source. Therefore, the section that typically contains findings and data discussion in a research article is replaced with a conceptual synthesis and empirical test design. This distinction is important to maintain academic integrity and prevent hypotheses from being presented as proven facts.

**CONCEPTUAL REVIEW: ISLAMIC PARTIES AND VOTING BEHAVIOR**

The term "Islamic party" requires a transparent definition. In electoral studies, the term can refer to parties that explicitly place Islam as the foundation of their ideology or organizational identity, parties with historical roots in Islamic movements, or parties that make the aspirations of Muslims a central part of their programs. These categories do not always overlap. Some parties may have a distinctly Islamic identity, while others accommodate religious aspirations without defining themselves as Islamic parties. Therefore, research should state which parties are included in the main categories and why that classification is chosen (F. Haviz dkk., 2025).

Operational definitions have direct consequences for comparative results. If the composition of party categories changes between the 2019 and 2024 elections, changes in aggregate votes may reflect changes in classification, rather than solely changes in voter behavior. Similarly, aggregating votes for parties with different social bases may mask internal dynamics. To mitigate these issues, the analysis should present data for each party first, then calculate aggregates based on predetermined criteria. Aggregate results should be supplemented with sensitivity analysis if any classifications are contested (Muwafiqoh dkk., 2023).

Voting behavior is often explained through several complementary approaches. Sociological approaches emphasize the influence of social environments, such as family, class, community, organizations, and group identities. Psychological approaches highlight party orientations, candidate imagery, political emotions, and attitudes formed through experience. Rational choice approaches view voters as actors who consider the benefits, costs, program promises, performance, and potential policy outcomes. These three elements need not be in absolute conflict. A voter can receive information from social networks, interpret it through group identities, and then compare candidates based on performance and household interests (F.


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Fauzan dkk., 2025).

A sociological approach helps explain why political choices can correlate with identity and social networks. However, this correlation does not necessarily mean that identity automatically determines choice. Individuals within a particular religious community may obtain political information from that network but still have room to evaluate candidates independently. Furthermore, members of the same community may choose different parties based on economic experiences, personal relationships with candidates, or assessments of the party's organization. Therefore, a robust analysis requires distinguishing between identity as a social setting, networks as channels of interaction, and voting preferences as political decisions (F. Fauzan dkk., 2025).

Psychological approaches focus on how voters form and maintain their orientations from one election to the next. Party loyalty, perceptions of candidate integrity, feelings of closeness, and evaluations of previous experiences can mediate the relationship between identity and behavior. In the context of repeated elections, voters may update their preferences based on experience, but this update does not always result in a shift in preferences. Voters may remain loyal because they feel the party still represents their values, because they see no better alternatives, or because they have strong social ties to the party's support network (M. Haviz & Maris, 2020).

The rational choice approach reminds us that identity is not the sole basis for choice. Voters may consider access to public services, development, employment, the price of necessities, education, health care, and a candidate's ability to champion regional interests. However, rationality need not be interpreted as purely individual economic calculations. Considerations deemed reasonable by voters may include moral obligation, trust in political figures, community interests, and consistency with religious values. Therefore, rational choice and religious identity can interact, rather than always being mutually exclusive (Rizal & Ramadhan, 2025).

Changes in voting behavior in Indonesia are also related to the personalization of politics. Under certain conditions, the candidate's personality becomes a greater focus than the party's platform or ideology. Popularity, communication skills, reputation, closeness to the public, and perceptions of leadership capacity can influence outcomes. This personalization does not automatically eliminate party influence. Candidates can benefit from personal reputation while leveraging organizational networks and party identity. Conversely, a popular candidate may not be successful if the organization is unable to mobilize voters or if their image does not align with the expectations of the target group (Muwafiqoh dkk., 2023).

The literature on Indonesian Islamic parties shows that the presence of an Islamic identity


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

does not always translate into comparable electoral success. These parties must compete with parties that have a broader voter base and can simultaneously articulate agendas of welfare, nationalism, and religious aspirations. Such competition creates challenges in converting symbolic capital: proximity to values or symbols does not automatically translate into votes if the party lacks an effective organization, acceptable candidates, or a perceived relevant agenda. Conversely, religious symbols can have greater political significance when connected to beliefs, organizational work, and a perceived positive track record (F. Fauzan dkk., 2025).

Thus, the research framework does not assume that West Sumatran voters always choose Islamic parties because of religion, or that national voters abandon Islamic parties because they have become pragmatic. Both of these assertions are overly simplistic. Instead, research needs to identify internal variation, examine when identity becomes relevant, and assess how voters connect values, candidates, programs, and political experiences. An adequate explanation must account not only for sustained support but also for voter shifts, regional differences, and the possibility that Islamic parties do not always benefit from their Islamic identity.

**MINANGKABAU POLITICAL CULTURE AND ABS-SBK**

Political culture can be understood as a collection of orientations, meanings, customs, and expectations that shape how citizens view power and political participation. Culture is not an immutable object, but rather a process of interpretation that occurs in social life. In West Sumatra, Minangkabau identity and the ABS-SBK philosophy provide a crucial moral language for understanding the relationship between custom, religion, and social life. This philosophy can serve as a source of social legitimacy for actors deemed capable of representing religious and customary values, but its influence on electoral choices depends on how these values are translated into political practice (I. Fauzan dkk., 2023).

ABS-SBK should not be treated as a single indicator that directly predicts party votes. The same cultural values can be articulated through diverse political attitudes. Some citizens may judge a party based on its Islamic identity; others may pay more attention to the integrity and capacity of candidates; and still others may separate personal piety from party choice. In societies with strong traditions of social discussion and judgment, cultural values can provide a basis for questioning elite behavior, not just for providing support. Therefore, research should consider the possibility that cultural identity strengthens support for certain parties, but can also be a source of criticism of parties or candidates deemed to fall short of moral standards (Zurqoni dkk., 2019).

The relationship between custom and religion can serve as a source of social capital.


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Shared values facilitate the formation of trust, coordination, and communication among citizens. However, social capital does not always lead to a single political outcome. Dense social networks can spread support, but also spread criticism, foster inter-elite competition, or reinforce differing preferences (Arifin dkk., 2025). Therefore, research should explore the form of networks, the intensity of interactions, the positions of actors, and the types of messages circulated, not just documenting that a community has a strong cultural and religious identity.

Local political culture also interacts with generational change, education, mobility, urbanization, and the use of digital media. Young voters may adopt Minangkabau and Islamic identities while using different sources of information than previous generations. They may combine advice from family or local figures with information found through social media. At the same time, digital platforms can expand the reach of political messages, but they also encourage the spread of inaccurate information, personalization, and fragmented communication. The crucial question, then, is not whether digital media replaces tradition, but rather how offline and online networks reinforce or challenge each other (I. Fauzan dkk., 2023).

Local culture has the potential to mediate party competition. In an environment that grants social legitimacy to Islamic symbols and language, Islamic parties may gain an initial advantage in the form of familiarity or identity congruence. However, this initial advantage will only translate into electoral support if conversion mechanisms are in place. These mechanisms could include the presence of local cadres, regular contact with residents, the candidate's reputation, social service work, program delivery skills, or the support of trusted figures. If conversion mechanisms are weak, symbolic congruence may not translate into sustained voter turnout (Zhang & Zhang, 2024).

The nagari context and local social relations are also important. Local social structures can be arenas for opinion formation, information exchange, and evaluation of elites. However, nagari are not homogeneous social units; they vary in interests, generations, professions, migration experiences, and relationships with formal institutions. Research must be careful not to portray Minangkabau society as a single political bloc. Differences between districts/cities and electoral districts should be treated as variations that can test whether suspected patterns apply broadly or are concentrated in specific areas.

Analytically, culture and ABS-SBK are positioned as contexts of meaning that can shape legitimacy, moral expectations, and social orientation. Their influence is not considered linear. It can be mediated by religious leaders, traditional elites, families, organizations, and citizens' experiences interacting with candidates. It can also be moderated by age, education, economic


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

conditions, location, or intensity of digital media use. With this framework, research can explain variations in support without making local identity the all-encompassing explanation.

**SOCIO-RELIGIOUS NETWORKS, LOCAL FIGURES, AND MOBILIZATION**

Socio-religious networks can serve as information channels, trust builders, and coordination tools. Religious organizations, religious study groups, educational institutions, mosque communities, religious study groups, and informal networks allow political messages to circulate through socially legitimate relationships. In many situations, voters do not process political information in isolation. They discuss candidates with family, friends, colleagues, or figures perceived as knowledgeable about the issues. These networks can lower information search costs, but they can also limit the variety of information available if communication occurs only within a homogeneous group (Van Staden & Coetzee, 2010).

The influence of religious figures should not be assumed to be uniform. A person's moral or scholarly authority does not automatically mean that all followers will follow the same political recommendations. Figures may choose not to offer partisan support, express general ethical considerations, or engage directly in mobilization. Public response to a figure's message also depends on credibility, behavioral consistency, social proximity, and the message's relevance to community experiences. Therefore, research interviews need to explore how informants understand the figure's influence, rather than simply asking them to confirm that the religious figure is influential (Hong dkk., 2022) .

Traditional elites and community leaders can play different roles than religious leaders, although in practice these roles may overlap. They can act as conflict mediators, liaisons with the government, aspiration managers, or assessors of candidate suitability. Their influence can stem from traditional status, experience, family ties, social services, or community organizing capacity. Research needs to assess whether the support provided is symbolic, takes the form of open statements, or is accompanied by measurable mobilization activities. This distinction is important because endorsements do not always result in observable voter turnout (F. Fauzan, 2020) .

Social networks can also explain the persistence of support between elections. When relationships between parties, cadres, and the public persist beyond the campaign period, political support can be sustained through repeated interactions. In contrast, networks that are only active around elections tend to rely on campaign resources or candidate popularity. A comparison of 2019 and 2024 could explore whether party organizations build sustainable relationships or rely more on short-term mobilization. This requires collecting data on organizational activity,


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

communication patterns, cadre turnover, and the continuity of public service .

However, strong networks do not necessarily favor Islamic parties. Social networks can create a space for competition between candidates from different parties, and voters can distinguish social connections from political choices. Individuals may remain members of the same religious community despite voting for different candidates. Therefore, the concept of networks must be distinguished from partisan loyalty. Social connections provide opportunities for influence, but the final decision remains influenced by individual interpretation, candidate evaluations, and the competitive context.

Electoral mobilization can occur through face-to-face communication, community meetings, candidate visits, volunteer activities, digital campaigns, and personal relationships. Effective strategies typically adapt messages to the social context without assuming that all voters share the same needs. Messages emphasizing identity may strengthen a sense of belonging for some groups, but may be deemed inadequate by voters more concerned with programmatic issues or integrity. Therefore, party strategy needs to be analyzed as a combination of message content, delivery channels, communicator credibility, and voter response.

In the era of social media, online and offline relationships are intertwined. Messages disseminated through digital platforms can gain legitimacy through local figures, while face-to-face conversations can reinforce or correct digital information. Social media also allows candidates to build personal brands without relying entirely on party structures. However, digital popularity does not equate to support at the polls. Indicators such as views, comments, or followers should not be treated as a substitute for election results. Research needs to examine how digital communication actually connects to organizational activities and voter perceptions (Muwafiqoh dkk., 2023).

From a research perspective, socio-religious networks are understood as connecting mechanisms between cultural contexts and political action. Evidence is needed not only to assert that a network exists, but also to examine how information flows, who is trusted, how messages are interpreted, and whether these relationships influence choices or participation. Evidence can be obtained through interviews with diverse groups of informants, observations of relevant activities, document analysis, and cross-regional comparisons. Using diverse sources helps prevent conclusions from relying solely on elite narratives or the perceptions of a single group.

**PARTY INSTITUTIONS, CANDIDATES, AND ELECTORAL STRATEGY**

A party's institutional capacity is a crucial factor linking social identity and aspirations to electoral outcomes. Parties with active local structures, well-known cadres, regular internal



Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

communication, and trusted recruitment mechanisms tend to have more means to maintain connections with voters. However, the presence of formal structures does not necessarily indicate effectiveness. Administratively registered organizations may be inactive, while informal candidate networks can play a significant role. Therefore, assessing party capacity needs to consider actual activities, continuity of cadre development, campaign coordination, and community relations (Sitorus & Fauzan, 2025).

Candidate recruitment is the intersection of organizational, personal reputation, and social representation. Candidates may be selected based on political experience, competence, popularity, resources, community ties, or networking abilities. These criteria can be mutually reinforcing but also create tensions. Popular candidates do not necessarily have strong programmatic commitments; long-standing members of the organization do not necessarily have electoral appeal; and candidates with significant resources do not necessarily command public trust. Research needs to explore how parties weigh these factors and how voters evaluate the candidates they nominate (Arifin dkk., 2025).

A candidate's personality can be a determining factor when voters perceive the party as a less obvious political vehicle or when the candidate has a distinguished track record. However, personalization is not the absolute opposite of ideology. Candidates can personalize Islamic values through behavior, communication, and social work that are perceived as consistent. In other situations, candidates may use religious symbols to create an image without demonstrating consistent performance. The distinction between substantive and symbolic representation needs to be examined by comparing campaign messages, candidate experiences, and citizen evaluations (I. Fauzan dkk., 2023).

Campaign strategies include targeting voters, formulating messages, selecting communication channels, organizing volunteers, and utilizing resources. Strategies that are successful in one region may not be effective in another due to differences in social structures, local issues, and candidate configurations. Therefore, comparative research cannot simply identify the strategies used; it must assess the context in which they were implemented and the mechanisms linking them to voter responses. This avoids the simple conclusion that social media use or support for a particular figure always leads to increased voter turnout (M. Haviz & Maris, 2020).

Party and candidate performance can be assessed through voters' experiences with service, access, responsiveness, and consistency of promises. These evaluations can be retrospective, assessing what has been done, or prospective, estimating the potential benefits if


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

the candidate is elected. Both orientations can interact with identity. Voters with ideological affinities may still punish candidates they perceive as failing, while voters without ideological allegiances may support candidates perceived as capable of advancing local interests. This demonstrates the importance of incorporating performance assessments as both a stand-alone variable and interacting with socio-cultural factors (I. Fauzan dkk., 2023).

Interparty competition also influences results. Votes for Islamic parties can shift because voters switch to other Islamic parties, switch to nationalist parties, or simply don't vote. Aggregate changes do not necessarily indicate the direction of individual shifts. Directly identifying shifts requires individual-level data that can be compared across time, whereas aggregate data only reveal collective change. Therefore, research must distinguish between conclusions that can be drawn from official election results and those that require surveys or voter interviews.

When interpreting the results of the 2019 and 2024 elections, it is also important to consider changes in voter turnout, participation rates, the number of participants, candidate distribution, and district configuration. If regional boundaries or participant composition change, comparisons should be adjusted or annotated. Absolute vote counts and vote percentages should be presented together. Seat comparisons are also important, but should not be considered equivalent to preference changes, as the conversion of votes into seats is influenced by the electoral system and the distribution of votes across districts. Accurate measurements are essential for constructing valid explanations.

**ISLAMIC POLITICS AND THE PERSPECTIVE OF FIQH SIYASAH**

This research falls within the realm of Islamic Studies, so electoral discussions need to connect empirical analysis with normative questions regarding power, representation, trust, and welfare. Fiqh siyasah can be understood as a domain of Islamic legal thought that addresses the management of public affairs, the governance of power, and the relationship between leaders and the public. In this article, fiqh siyasah is not used as a tool to determine the correct political choice for voters, but rather as an interpretive lens to assess the ethical dimensions of representational practices and electoral competition (Syuhud & Farid, 2025).

The concept of trustworthiness directs attention to the mandate holder's responsibility to exercise authority honestly and responsibly. In the context of elections, trustworthiness relates to the candidate's integrity, consistency between promises and actions, and willingness to explain decisions to citizens. This concept can be linked to empirical questions: whether voters value integrity as a key factor, how they construct this assessment, and whether it differs across regions


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

or social groups. Thus, normative concepts do not replace data but help define dimensions that need to be examined (Velander dkk., 2023).

Public interest reminds us that politics is not only about identity or organizational victory, but also about public benefit. In electoral competition, parties and candidates make claims about development, welfare, education, healthcare, and justice. Research can examine how voters understand public interest, which programs they deem important, and how assessments of the public interest relate to electoral support. Care must be taken not to reduce public interest to campaign slogans or be measured solely by candidates' claims; this concept demands an examination of the substance, process, and consequences of policies.

Deliberation provides a normative foundation for participation, exchange of opinions, and respect for shared deliberation. In local contexts, social discussion spaces can be a place for citizens to weigh political information and evaluate candidates. However, deliberation is not always equitable. Power relations, social status, patronage, and peer pressure can influence who speaks and whose views are dominant. Therefore, a normative perspective needs to be juxtaposed with empirical observations regarding inclusiveness, freedom of expression, and the possibility of pressure or dependency.

The perspective of Islamic jurisprudence also helps distinguish between religious symbols and ethical-political qualities. The use of Islamic identity in campaigns does not automatically indicate that a practice fulfills the values of trust or public welfare. Conversely, programs oriented toward public service can have moral relevance even without explicit religious rhetoric. Assessments must be based on practice, accountability, and consequences, not just symbols. In research, this prevents the simplification that parties using the Islamic label necessarily represent all Islamic political values substantively.

The use of a normative perspective also requires maintaining societal plurality and political freedom. Communities with relatively strong religious or cultural identities still consist of citizens with differing aspirations, interpretations, and interests. Academic analysis should not assume one electoral choice as the sole legitimate expression of Islam. The focus should be on understanding the relationship between belief, organization, representation, and political behavior while respecting citizens' right to make choices. This perspective is crucial to prevent research on Islamic politics from devolving into one-sided moral judgments of voters or political groups.

Thus, fiqh siyasah in this article serves three functions. First, it provides a normative language for discussing the responsibilities and purposes of power. Second, it helps assess the gap


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

between religious claims and political practices. Third, it directs recommendations toward strengthening accountability, participation, and the public good. These three functions are placed after and alongside empirical analysis, not as a substitute for proving voter turnout or voting behavior mechanisms.

**ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH PROPOSITIONS**

The article's analytical framework positions the electoral paradox as the result of the interaction of several layers. The first layer is the macro context, encompassing the national party system, electoral competition, political personalization, media changes, and welfare issues. The second layer is the local context, including Minangkabau culture, ABS-SBK, social structure, organizational history, and regional economic and political conditions. The third layer is intermediary mechanisms, such as socio-religious networks, the authority of prominent figures, cadre activities, campaign communications, and candidate reputation. The fourth layer is voter decisions and the aggregate results reflected in votes and seats. This layered model prevents explanations that directly link regional identity to election results without examining the mechanisms (F. Fauzan dkk., 2025).

The first proposition states that cultural values and religious identity can increase the relevance of political messages that align with citizens' social experiences, but this influence depends on the credibility of the actor and how those values are articulated. If a party or candidate is perceived as inconsistent with their claimed values, symbolic congruence may not generate support. This proposition can be tested through comparisons of campaign narratives, voter interviews, and regional variations in voter turnout. Researchers should also look for evidence that refutes the proposition, such as regions with strong religious identities that lack increased support for Islamic parties (Sitorus & Fauzan, 2025).

The second proposition states that socio-religious networks can help maintain support if they provide information, build trust, and connect voters with candidates repeatedly. The effect is expected to be stronger when the relationships extend beyond the campaign period and when the individual or organization has credibility. Conversely, if the network is merely ceremonial or experiences internal conflict, its mobilizing influence may be limited (Zurqoni dkk., 2019). Tests need to examine the intensity of interactions, the continuity of activities, and the relationship between the network and political choice, not just the existence of the organization.

The third proposition states that a party's institutional capacity influences its ability to convert identity and social support into votes. Active local organizations can maintain


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

communication, select candidates, coordinate volunteers, and respond to aspirations. If the party structure is weak, support may be more dependent on specific figures and vulnerable to change when candidates change. Comparing two elections provides an opportunity to examine whether parties that retain votes also exhibit organizational continuity, but such a relationship should not be assumed to be causal without sufficient evidence.

The fourth proposition states that candidate quality and performance evaluations can strengthen or weaken the influence of identity. Candidates perceived as competent and possessing integrity can enhance party identity; candidates perceived as not meeting expectations can diminish support, even if the party has strong social roots. This proposition requires that research separate assessments of party, candidate, and policy. If data only show party votes, research cannot conclude whether voters support them because of identity or because of individual candidates.

The fifth proposition states that digital media is not a standalone factor, but rather a channel whose effectiveness depends on the credibility of the source, the distribution network, and its connection to offline activities. Digital campaigns can expand a candidate's reach and shape their image, but their conversion into votes needs to be tested. Research can compare digital narratives with in-person activities, examine the role of volunteers, and interview voters about the sources of information they find credible. Evidence of online popularity should be used only as context, not as a substitute for electoral outcomes.

The sixth proposition states that local paradoxes can arise because the same factors have different weights in different regions. Rationality, identity, and personalization should not be understood as mutually exclusive trends. In one context, voters may use identity to determine a group of candidates they deem worthy and then compare the candidates' performance within that group. In other contexts, performance assessments may precede identity. An integrative model allows for such variation to be explained without assuming a single factor is always dominant.

This framework also establishes several alternative explanations that should be tested. Strengthening aggregate vote share may be due to changes in voter turnout, participation, candidate distribution, or interparty competition, rather than simply increased religiosity. The performance of specific candidates may boost party votes without indicating a shift in loyalty to Islamic parties in general. Furthermore, different Islamic parties may experience contrasting patterns, allowing provincial aggregates to mask internal shifts. Including alternative explanations is not a weakness of the research, but rather a requirement for building a credible argument.


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

The analytical process can be summarized as follows: the phenomenon of vote swings is identified through official data; national and local patterns are compared; regional and inter-party variations are examined; social, cultural, organizational, candidate, and communication mechanisms are explored through qualitative data; alternative explanations are tested; and then all evidence is synthesized from a fiqh siyasah perspective. The resulting model must explain the relationships between factors, the conditions under which factors operate, and the limits of their validity. A model should not simply be a list of factors; it should show how these factors interact to produce sustained or changing support.

## RESEARCH METHODS

This article employs a mixed methods design with a sequential explanatory pattern. This approach begins with quantitative analysis to identify patterns of change, then continues with qualitative analysis to explain the mechanisms that may underlie those patterns. This choice aligns with the nature of the problem: comparing election results requires consistent measures, while explaining culture, networks, and voter decisions requires exploring meanings and processes. The two approaches are not simply placed side by side but integrated throughout the informant selection, question formulation, interpretation, and synthesis stages.

Substantively, this research is an empirical-sociological study with an Islamic political and Islamic jurisprudence approach. A longitudinal comparative design was used to compare the 2019 and 2024 elections at two scales: national and West Sumatra Province. The term "longitudinal" in this context refers to a comparison of two electoral moments, not necessarily a continuous follow-up of the same individuals. In the absence of voter panel data, the study cannot infer individual voter shifts directly from aggregate changes. The limits of this inference must be explicitly stated.

The primary quantitative data consists of official election result documents that allow for measurement of the number and percentage of party votes. The preferred source is election organizer publications, including national, provincial, district/city, and electoral district data, if available in a comparable format. Seat count data can be used as a supplementary indicator. Prior to analysis, researchers should check for uniformity in party categories, data completeness, changes in electoral district boundaries, and possible differences in reporting formats. Data that are not directly comparable should be highlighted and not forced into a single series of numbers.

The definition of Islamic parties is explicitly established based on accountable criteria. Each party categorized should be listed along with the rationale for its classification, while ambiguous cases should be explained in the methodological notes. Quantitative analysis is conducted by


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

calculating the absolute change and percentage change in the vote between two elections. Absolute change is calculated from the difference in the number of votes; percentage change is calculated from the difference in vote share within the total valid votes cast for the same unit of analysis. Both indicators are presented together to avoid misinterpreting changes in voter turnout as changes in relative support.

The analysis was conducted at several levels of aggregation. The national level served as a comparison to determine the general trend, while the provincial level revealed patterns in West Sumatra. If sufficient data were available, the analysis continued at the district/city and electoral district levels to identify internal variations. Using multiple levels of aggregation is important because provincial patterns can mask local differences. If Islamic party votes increase in some regions but decrease in others, the explanation should describe the distribution of these changes, rather than conclude that all provinces exhibit the same pattern.

The qualitative phase is aimed at explaining quantitative results that require deeper understanding. Potential informants include party officials and cadres, candidates or former candidates, religious leaders, traditional leaders, community leaders, local political observers, and voters from diverse backgrounds. Informants were selected purposively based on their knowledge, experience, and relevance to the research questions. If necessary, a snowballing technique can be used to find additional informants, but researchers must maintain a diversity of perspectives and avoid relying on a single elite network.

In-depth interviews were used to explore perceptions of party identity, the significance of ABS-SBK in political life, the influence of social networks, candidate evaluations, campaign strategies, voter experiences, and perceived changes between 2019 and 2024. Questions should be open-ended to avoid leading informants to repeat the researcher's hypothesis. For example, instead of asking whether religion determines choice, researchers could ask what factors are considered, who sources of information are used, how candidates are evaluated, and whether these considerations have changed over time. This technique helps reduce confirmation bias.

Observation and documentation complement interviews. Observations can be conducted at relevant public or organizational events, with due regard for ethics, consent, and the safety of informants. Documentation includes campaign materials, party statements, organizational publications, news items, election reports, and policy documents. Each document should be assessed based on its origin, date, purpose of publication, and the potential interests of its creator. Campaign materials, for example, indicate how a party wants to be perceived, but do not necessarily prove that voters received the message.



Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Qualitative analysis is conducted through transcription, repeated reading, initial coding, grouping codes into categories, developing themes, and exploring relationships between themes. Initial categories might include religious identity, ABS-SBK, figure authority, social networks, organizational activities, candidate qualities, economic issues, digital media, and performance appraisals. However, these categories should not rigidly limit the data. New themes emerging from the interviews need to be considered and documented. Researchers should keep a track of analytical decisions so readers can understand how interpretations are constructed.

Method integration occurs at several points. Quantitative results can indicate which regions or parties have experienced the greatest change, which then helps select locations and informants for the qualitative phase. Interview findings are then used to explain patterns, identify mechanisms, and test alternative explanations. If quantitative and qualitative data do not align, the discrepancy should be analyzed, not dismissed. For example, party elites may rate organizational networks as highly effective, while voters state that their choice was primarily based on candidate performance. This difference in perspective can itself be a significant finding.

Data validity was strengthened through triangulation of sources, techniques, and time. Source triangulation was conducted by comparing explanations from informants with different positions. Technical triangulation was conducted by comparing interviews, observations, and documents. Time triangulation was conducted by examining whether narratives about 2019 and 2024 were consistent and whether informants reinterpreted their experiences after the election results were known. Reviewing transcripts, discussions with supervisors or other researchers, and reflexive recording can also help identify researcher bias (F. Haviz & Yakub, 2025).

Ethical considerations include ensuring informant consent, explaining the research objectives, ensuring anonymity when requested or required, secure data storage, and respecting the informant's right to remain anonymous. Political research can touch on sensitive affiliations, conflicts, and power relations. Therefore, interview quotations must be carefully selected to avoid inadvertently revealing identities or posing risks to informants. Researchers also need to distinguish publishable data from limited background information (F. Fauzan dkk., 2025).

The fiqh siyasah perspective is applied at the normative interpretation stage after the empirical evidence has been analyzed. Normative analysis considers trust, benefit, deliberation, justice, and accountability as concepts for assessing the quality of political representation. This perspective is not used to replace election results data, and should not lead researchers to conclude voter motives based solely on normative categories. Thus, this method maintains a balance between empirical explanations of political behavior and Islamic scholarly reflection on


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

the ethics of power.

## DISCUSSION

### EXPLAINING THE ELECTORAL PARADOX

The electoral paradox is best understood as a matter of variation, not as an exception to be explained by a single regional characteristic. National trends are the aggregate of regions with different histories, social structures, voter compositions, and party configurations. Therefore, it is not surprising that a province exhibits a pattern that differs from the national figure. What requires explanation is whether these differences are consistent, how large they are, and what mechanisms might explain them. These questions can only be answered after systematic comparison of official data.

One possible explanation is that local culture and religious identity enhance the symbolic connection between voters and Islamic parties. However, this explanation is only adequate if it can demonstrate how this symbolic connection translates into electoral decisions. Identity may influence initial perceptions of party viability, but voters still evaluate candidates and programs. Thus, identity may function as an interpretive framework, not as a precept that automatically determines choice. Research should uncover evidence of this interpretive process, including cases where identity does not generate the expected support. (F. Fauzan, 2020)

A second possibility is the existence of socio-religious networks capable of maintaining political interactions beyond the campaign period. Sustainable networks can serve as an infrastructure of trust and communication. They help candidates reach voters, provide information, and maintain relationships between elections. However, networks can also give rise to competition and fragmentation. If multiple figures or organizations support different candidates, voters may receive diverse recommendations. Therefore, network effectiveness cannot be measured solely by the number of organizations or the status of figures but must be analyzed through how the network operates in a specific context.

A third possibility is the party's organizational capacity. Sustained support from one election to the next may indicate the existence of local structures, a functioning cadre, or the party's ability to maintain relationships with constituents. However, support may also be contingent on specific candidate figures and may not reflect overall organizational strengthening. Comparisons of party votes and candidate information should be considered in conjunction. If the increase occurs only in parties with candidates with strong personal networks, then candidate-based explanations may be more appropriate than claims of a general ideological revival of the


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

party (I. Fauzan dkk., 2023).

The fourth possibility relates to how voters combine identity and performance considerations. Narratives about the weakening of Islamic parties at the national level often attribute this shift in preferences to pragmatism. However, pragmatism need not necessarily mean secularization or the loss of religious identity. Voters can maintain a strong sense of Islam while demanding that candidates demonstrate competence, integrity, and beneficial programs. Within this framework, Islamic parties can survive when they successfully combine identity alignment with perceived performance. Conversely, the Islamic label alone is insufficient if the candidate or organization is perceived as failing (M. Haviz & Maris, 2020).

A fifth possibility is that aggregate strengthening does not reflect a uniform shift in orientation across all voters. Voter turnout could increase due to the addition of new voters, changes in turnout, or voter shifts from other parties. Aggregate data cannot definitively determine which mechanism is at play. Therefore, claims of societal ideological change require additional evidence, such as attitude surveys, voter interviews, or panel data. Without such evidence, it is more accurate to state that election results demonstrate an aggregate pattern that needs to be explained rather than to conclude that society as a whole is becoming more politically religious (Muwafiqoh dkk., 2023).

Analysis also needs to consider intergenerational variations. Younger voters may interpret religious and cultural identity differently than older generations. They may obtain information from digital platforms, evaluate candidates based on education and job opportunities, and maintain a close connection to local cultural symbols. If this pattern is found, it would demonstrate that tradition and modernity are not always interchangeable. They can blend through new forms of participation and different communication channels. (F. Haviz dkk., 2025)

From a party system perspective, the case of West Sumatra can help test whether the nationalization of political competition results in a convergence of preferences across regions. National parties operate within the same institutional and media framework, but they face different local social and organizational structures. If Islamic parties maintain support in West Sumatra, it may indicate that national competition remains mediated by local conditions. Thus, the party system is shaped not only by aggregate trends but also by the interaction between national strategies and subnational organizations (F. Haviz dkk., 2025).

It's also important to distinguish support for Islamic parties from support for candidates who identify as Muslim or use Islamic symbols. Candidate identity is not synonymous with party identity, and support for a particular candidate does not necessarily reflect loyalty to the


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

organization. Research that fails to distinguish between these two levels risks conflating different phenomena. Therefore, interviews should ask about reasons for choosing candidates and parties separately, while analysis of election results should consider whether votes were cast for parties, legislative candidates, or the presidential election (Tanjung dkk., 2023).

Discussions of paradoxes should also maintain the possibility that the initial premise may be revised. If data comparisons indicate that gains occurred only in some parties or regions, conclusions should be narrowed. If the data do not support claims of national decline for a given party category, national comparisons should be reformulated. If percentage changes differ from vote share changes, both patterns should be reported. Good research does not retain the term paradox at the expense of accuracy; instead, it allows definitions and claims to be refined based on evidence (F. Haviz & Yakub, 2025).

Within the framework of Islamic jurisprudence, the interpretation of the paradox is not directed at judging one group of voters as morally superior to another. The normative focus is on how parties and candidates obtain mandates, are accountable for promises, and strive for public welfare. Strong support constitutes a political mandate, not automatic evidence of the quality of government. Similarly, religious identity does not eliminate the need for accountability. This perspective broadens the meaning of election results from electoral victory to questions of representation, integrity, and public benefit (F. Fauzan, 2022).

Overall, the most promising explanation is not to single out one factor as the sole cause, but rather to examine the combination and sequence of mechanisms. Culture can shape the framework of meaning; networks provide channels of trust; organizations coordinate mobilization; candidates provide personal face and track record; and policy issues help voters assess merits. The weight of each factor can vary across location and time. Such a model is better suited to explaining why local patterns can differ from national trends without assuming West Sumatra is homogeneous or isolated from Indonesia's political changes.

## CONCLUSION

This article formulates the West Sumatra electoral paradox as an academic issue concerning the discrepancy between national trends and patterns of support for Islamic parties in the 2019 and 2024 elections. The article positions the alleged strengthening of support in West Sumatra as a claim that needs to be tested through official data and qualitative explanations. Because the fieldwork has not yet been reported as completed, this article does not present results, does not establish factors as proven causes, and does not claim final empirical conclusions.



Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

The analytical framework developed emphasizes the interaction of Minangkabau political culture and ABS-SBK, religious identity, socio-religious networks, the role of local figures, party institutions, candidate quality, campaign strategies, and voter evaluations of performance. These factors are not assumed to operate automatically or uniformly. Identity can serve as a framework for meaning, networks as a channel for information, organizations as a means of coordination, and candidates as a point of personal evaluation; their influence depends on the credibility, context, and experience of citizens.

A mixed methods sequential explanatory design is considered appropriate because it combines quantitative comparisons with qualitative explanations. Vote count and percentage data need to be analyzed separately and at multiple levels of aggregation. Interviews, observations, and documentation are then used to explore mechanisms and test alternative explanations. Triangulation and research ethics are essential, especially since political affiliation can be sensitive information. A fiqh siyasah perspective enriches interpretation by emphasizing trustworthiness, benefit, deliberation, and accountability without replacing empirical evidence.

The article's primary contribution is to offer a way of reading local cases as a means of testing the limits of the generalizability of theories of voting behavior. If a paradox is evident, the explanation needs to address the conditions under which socio-cultural contexts, networks, organizations, and candidates interact to produce a different pattern. If the evidence suggests internal variation or does not support the overall strengthening claim, the conclusions must be adjusted. Thus, the quality of the research lies not in the justification of the initial premises, but in the ability to produce explanations that are transparent, testable, and relevant to the study of Islamic politics in Indonesia.

## FURTHER RESEARCH DIRECTION

The next step requires verifying and compiling an official database of the 2019 and 2024 election results, with an explicit definition of Islamic parties. Ideally, the database should include vote counts, vote share, seats, territorial units, and records of boundary changes or election participants. Initial analysis should present each party before grouping them into categories. This allows readers to assess whether aggregate patterns reflect common trends or mask internal differences.

Further qualitative research should select locations based on variations in electoral patterns, not solely on ease of access. Areas with vote gains, areas with stable vote gains, and areas with declining vote gains can be compared to identify conditions that differentiate


Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

outcomes. Informants should include elites and ordinary voters, supporters of Islamic parties and voters who choose other parties, as well as diverse age groups and social backgrounds. This strategy helps mitigate bias that arises when data is collected only from those with a vested interest in highlighting the party's success.

Further research could also consider voter surveys to examine the relationship between identity, performance evaluations, trust in political figures, media use, and party choice. If surveys are conducted after an election, researchers should be mindful of recall bias and post-decision rationalization. Panel data, which track respondents over time, can help distinguish attitude change from voter change, but require more resources and a more complex ethical design. In any design, causal claims must be balanced against the quality of the data and the research design.

Finally, comparative studies with other provinces can help determine whether the mechanisms found in West Sumatra are unique or emerge in different cultural contexts and religious networks. Cross-regional comparisons will clarify the theoretical boundary conditions and strengthen contributions to the study of Islamic politics. However, such comparisons should be conducted after the definitions, indicators, and analysis of the West Sumatra case have been well-defined to ensure the differences found can be fully interpreted.

**REFERENCE**

Arifin, A., Ritonga, F., & Fauzan, I. (2025). Voting behavior in mayoral election: A case study in Sibolga city, Indonesia. Multidisciplinary Science Journal. https://doi.org/10.31893/multiscience.2025419

Fauzan, F. (2020). PROGRESSIVE LAW PARADIGM IN ISLAMIC FAMILY LAW RENEWAL IN INDONESIA. Jurnal Ilmiah Mizani: Wacana Hukum, Ekonomi Dan Keagamaan. https://doi.org/10.29300/mzn.v7i2.3617

Fauzan, F. (2022). Alternatives to Criminal Conviction in a Comparative Analysis of Positive Law and Islamic Criminal Law. Al-Istinbath : Jurnal Hukum Islam. https://doi.org/10.29240/jhi.v7i1.4308

Fauzan, F., Andiko, T., Kosasih, A., Rohmadi, R., Jalili, I., & Miinuddin, M. (2025). Local Wisdom-Based Democracy: A Fiqh Siyasah Analysis of the Gilir Kaum System in the Village Head Election in Sibak Village, Bengkulu. Jurnal Ilmiah Mizani: Wacana Hukum, Ekonomi Dan Keagamaan. https://doi.org/10.29300/mzn.v12i2.8991

Fauzan, I., Arifin, A., Dalimunthe, M. A., & Rahmadani, S. (2023). The configuration of ethnic and religious relations towards the 2024 general election: A case study in Medan, Indonesia.



Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Multidisciplinary Science Journal. https://doi.org/10.31893/multiscience.2024006

Harza, M. F. (2023). Efektivitas Organisasi Komisi Pemilihan Umum Kota Bukittinggi dalam Meningkatkan Partisipasi Pemilih pada Pemilu Serentak Tahun 2024. PUBLICNESS: Journal of Public Administration Studies. https://doi.org/10.24036/publicness.v2i1.79

Haviz, F., Viona, A. N., Ramadhan, A., Srimufi, M., Albert, E., & Mairul, M. (2025). Inkonsistensi Aturan Keterwakilan Perempuan dalam Pelakasanaan Pemilu 2024 dalam Perspektif Feminis Legal Teori. PUAN INDONESIA. https://doi.org/10.37296/jpi.v6i2.232

Haviz, F., & Yakub, Y. (2025). ANALISIS YURIDIS MEDIASI KEMENTERIAN HUKUM DALAM PENYELESAIAN KONFLIK DUALISME KEPEMIMPINAN DI IKATAN NOTARIS INDONESIA. IURIS NOTITIA : JURNAL ILMU HUKUM. https://doi.org/10.69916/iuris.v3i1.233

Haviz, M., & Maris, I. (2020). Measuring Mathematics and Science Teachers' Perception on Thinking and Acting in 21st-Century Learning. Journal for the Education of Gifted Young Scientists. https://doi.org/10.17478/jegys.747395

Hong, W., Guo, R., & Wang, W. (2022). A diagrammatic method for the identification and resolution of urban spatial conflicts. Journal of environmental management, 316, 115297. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2022.115297

Muwafiqoh, A., Fauzan, F., & Shidiq, S. (2023). Local Government Policy in Improving the Quality of Islamic Religious Education in Bogor Regency. Scaffolding: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam dan Multikulturalisme. https://doi.org/10.37680/scaffolding.v5i2.3132

Rizal, A., & Ramadhan, F. S. (2025). Muhammadiyah in the Dynamics of Ideology. Analisis Sejarah: Mencari Jalan Sejarah. https://doi.org/10.25077/jas.v15i2.142

Sitorus, A., & Fauzan, I. (2025). The role of the plantation elite of PT PTPN IV Bandar Pasir Mandoge Unit in the 2024 presidential and vice presidential elections. Priviet Social Sciences Journal. https://doi.org/10.55942/pssj.v5i11.907

Syuhud, & Farid, A. (2025). Driving Quality Through People: Strategic Human Resource Management in Indonesian Islamic Schools. Managere: Indonesian Journal of Educational Management. https://doi.org/10.52627/managere.v7i4.1234

Tanjung, Y., Ginting, B., & Fauzan, I. (2023). Analysis of Obstacles to Policy Handling Profiteering Support for Political Party Membership at the Registration Stage Candidates for the 2024 Election in the City of Tanjung Balai. JPPUMA Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan dan Sosial Politik Universitas Medan Area. https://doi.org/10.31289/jppuma.v11i2.9981

Van Staden, W., & Coetzee, K. (2010). Conceptual relations between loneliness and culture. Current Opinion in Psychiatry, 23, 524. https://doi.org/10.1097/yco.0b013e32833f2ff9



Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License

Velander, J., Taiye, M. A., Otero, N., & Milrad, M. (2023). Artificial Intelligence in K-12 Education: Eliciting and reflecting on Swedish teachers' understanding of AI and its implications for teaching & learning. Education and Information Technologies, 29, 4085–4105. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10639-023-11990-4

Zhang, J., & Zhang, Z. (2024). AI in teacher education: Unlocking new dimensions in teaching support, inclusive learning, and digital literacy. J. Comput. Assist. Learn., 40, 1871–1885. https://doi.org/10.1111/jcal.12988

Zurqoni, Z., Arbain, M., & Fauzan, U. (2019). The Dynamics of the Development of Islamic Education in Southeast Asia. 2, 71–99. https://doi.org/10.21093/bijis.v2i1.1849



Copyright at authors some right reserved this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution-Share Alike 4.0 International License